



BOARD OF ANIMAL SERVICES COMMISSIONERS
CITY OF LOS ANGELES



MINUTES

TUESDAY, October 28, 2014 at 7:00 PM

West Los Angeles Animal Shelter Center
11361 West Pico Boulevard
Los Angeles, California 90064

Audio MP-3 Recording is available at www.laanimalservices.com

David Zaft, President
Alana Yañez, Vice-President
Jennifer Brent
Larry Gross
Roger Wolfson

Meeting called to order at 7:02 p.m. by Board Secretary, Rita Moreno, Los Angeles Animal Services (LAAS). Roll call. Commissioners present were Zaft, Brent, Gross and Yañez. Also present: General Manager (GM) Brenda Barnette, Assistant General Manager (AGM) John Chavez and Deputy City Attorney (DCA) Marcia Gonzales-Kimbrough.

Commissioner Zaft provided an overview of the agenda.

- 1. PUBLIC COMMENT SPEAKERS:** **Kristina Kirstin:** Has been rescuing animals for 15 years; animals need protection - background checks and follow-up are needed for those who want to adopt animals, \$100 is not a deterrent. **Bruce Robinson:** Adopted Lucky – good dog, crippled and with bone disease; recognized Ady and others who rescue animals, more help is needed. **Marla Tauscher:** Attorney; alleged policy of using informants to bust animal people; questioned whether background checks are conducted on informants. **Paula Hsien:** Discussed 85 degree animal walking rule (read emails); does not believe it is based on scientific data. **Billie Baier:** (Read LAAS mission statement) discussed the back rooms in the WLA kennel and the environment in which evidence dogs are maintained; discussed length of time and impacts. **Daniel Guss:** Introduced candidate for City Council, Jay Beeber; congratulated Commission for its decision on use of AWTF. **Lisa Edmondson:** Thanked Commission and GM for rabbit microchipping so they can be followed; would like effort to curtail availability of baby rabbits. **Jumana Peermohammed:** Volunteer at W. Valley Animal Shelter; discussed inability to socialize cats in isolation and requested she be told if she is doing something wrong; stated she follows protocols. **Gabriele Hartel:** West Valley Officer; speaking on behalf of Officers regarding reassignment of animal control vehicles; they are left with oldest truck and vans; trucks have no air conditioning, only ventilation; vans important at night for easier loading; vans have heating in winter. **Kris Nakashima:** Volunteer; commented on sprinkler system that is not working; artificial turf does not cool down for animals; foster program needs more advertising; additional staff is needed. **Phyllis Daugherty:** Supported Officer's comments about trucks; said vans are parked at North Central, those at Harbor need to be fixed; discussed staffing and emergency appointments for lieutenants. **Michelle Cornelius:** Volunteer; discussed dog "Mikey" and disagreed with behavior assessment by staff. **Ady Gil:** Submitted CPRA request; read document provided when adopting an animal; read statement on abusing an animal; discussed dog "Lucky" and "Tren" and their health conditions. **Diane De Stefano:** Need more ACT as volunteers do "ACT work" and not enough time socializing animals; programs not in place to test dogs and whether they are dog friendly – issue for

those adopting. **Cathy Serksnas:** Passed around flyer on puppy “Bronco” with fractured leg brought into West Valley shelter and questioned medical care. **Teri Austin:** Amanda Foundation; discussed microchips and contract clause that phone number be placed on home page for Found Animals; difficult to ascertain where microchips come from – needs to be user friendly. **Michael Bell:** League of Human Voters and Citizens for a Humane Los Angeles; discussed Latino animal welfare foundation and its work; asked for department to work with Kinder rescue to assist with spaying and neutering animals. **Jay Beever:** Sherman Oaks NC; candidate for City Council; discussed animal welfare background in New Jersey. **Whitney Smith:** Discussed pit bull “Sugar” kept in shelter 110 days because owner in jail; discussed animal microchip scanners going to PAW Committee; Found Animals package includes only 30 scanners; discussed CEQA cat study and asked about money; Marie Timer estate \$41,000 for animal programs in 2012 and asked how much has been spent to benefit animals. **Mana Haeri:** Bunny World Foundation; add bunnies and rabbits to companion animals; enforcement of spay/neuter for bunnies and rabbits. **Jenna Shiner:** Volunteer; need better education system for employees to administer behavior marks. **Kelly Williams:** Volunteer; discussed customer service training for ACTs and impact on whether animals will be adopted. **Charla Fales:** ACT at WLA, with City 17 years; thanked being able to attend Best Friends conference; ACTs needed – not able to get to all work; staff working out of class, dealing with injuries. **Tracy James:** Volunteer 6 years; discussed customer service and suggested name tags so people know who their dealing with; recommended volunteer recognition and potlucks; SEO (search engine optimization) needs to be enhanced for easier search of shelter; bring back shelter liaison. **Fran Reichenbach:** Beachwood Canyon NA; supports wildlife program and Officer Randall’s work, and would like Captain Bowers back. **Josh Liddy:** Disagreed with recommendation for mandatory home and background checks as they would be costly, bureaucratic and selectively enforced. **Lisa Arturo:** Hope for Paws Animal Rescue - pays for animal medical care; discussed homeless camp in Venice Beach and lack of attention by ACTs; homeless don’t take care of animals - get special treatment; South Central does not have puppy or kitten bottles or formula. **Robert Green:** Rescue organization in Central CA; thanked Commission/department for work at City’s animal shelters. **Gail Raft:** Discussed rescued cat and need for intervention program at East Valley Animal Shelter; people need to put animals down because not enough money. **Mary Catalano:** Discussed Best Friends and donated shelter – not talking care of animals; bad decision of working with Found Animals for microchipping.

Commissioner Zaft: Recognized Norman Kulla from Councilmember Bonin’s Office and Joan Pelico from Councilmember Koretz’ Office; thanked public for attending and providing their comments, which are taken into account.

2. COMMISSION BUSINESS

A. Approval of Minutes for October 14, 2014.

Public Comments:

Dan Guss: Questioned minutes regarding GM Barnette’s report on music system; item 5A on response times; item 6B regarding \$9,000 on vehicle racks?

Commissioner Zaft: Clarified and confirmed that the music system had been

Please join us at our website: www.LAAnimalservices.com

previously approved and that the vehicle wraps were approved.

Commissioner Gross made a motion to approve the minutes as is and Commissioner Yañez seconded. The vote was 4 – 0 in favor.

3. ORAL REPORT OF THE GENERAL MANAGER

GM Barnette shared the following:

- Yesterday, two banners were hung at the old South LA shelter informing the public that the shelter is closed, animal abandonment is a crime, and the location of the new shelter at Chesterfield Square, in English and Spanish.
- A memo was sent to Controller Galperin notifying him that the Department is in full compliance with the 2011 fiscal audit. We are requesting confirmation from his office that he is in agreement with our position.
- Earlier today, the City Council approved the Department's recommendation to microchip all rabbits. The City Attorney now needs to develop a draft ordinance relative to this recommendation, and have it heard and approved by the PAW Committee and full Council.
- At the next PAW Committee, November 4th, the Committee is expected to hear the Department's request to exempt up to 20 Animal License Canvassers. These positions are critical for the Department's initiative to increase public safety and licensing revenues. Clarified that actual number is 12, but need permission to refill in the future. [Commissioner Zaft asked whether there were enough applicants and GM Barnette responded affirmatively].
- Relative to the injunction on feral cats and the proposal of a cat program related to this issue, our Department continues to work with the City Attorney on this. As we get more details, I will provide you with updates. Added that the largest euthanized population in the shelters is feral cats so it's imperative this issue is resolved.
- The Mayor's Office is pushing departments to have their websites ADA-compliant. This has required significant effort on departmental staff to meet relatively tight deadlines. I'm happy to announce that our home page and pages related to emergency preparedness are in full compliance. We were recently informed that we passed and that our sites had zero errors. Congratulations to our IT staff and Christal Chacon for this team effort.
- Some of my staff and I attended the No More Homeless Pets Bets Friends National Conference last week. Some of the "takeaway" concepts we're exploring are:
 - Attendees were about 50 percent municipal and 50 private shelters and rescues – indication of blending of efforts.
 - Animal Control Officers can be the outreach team, the eyes and ears of the Department and create a positive image while enforcing important laws such as licensing and spay/neuter. Alana maybe will help in training efforts for staff.

Please join us at our website: www.LAAnimalservices.com

- In some of the closed sessions with national leaders we worked on ideas around sustainability for the no kill movement and for placing larger dogs.
 - National effort to invite rescues and the community to use “partner with” instead of “rescue from” shelters. Too often the community does not understand what we do and can do and they blame the shelters for a community problem. This does not create a collaborative relationship that will benefit the animals and people or increase shelter efficiency.
 - Foster programs are critical to give shelter pets home care while they wait for a home of their own. Some shelters have programs where they “loan dogs” for the weekend or as jogging partners. We need to discuss a creative approach to getting the dogs out of the shelter and get exercise.
 - Several members of our team focused on programs around volunteerism and how to improve their experience and motivate them.
 - There was a full range of topics to select from and sessions were conducted by experts from all over the US.
-
- We are making progress about getting music in the shelters. Louis Dedeaux had a walk-through with the Information Technology Agency. There are some technical glitches related to volume control and splitting up the PA system to allow music outside and none inside. (Commissioner Zaft mentioned the music being provided by staff until the system is in place). We will continue to work this out and update you.
 - The “Fur is Flying” event, held October 18 and 19th was a success. Adoptions totaled 218 compared to 211 last year.
 - The “Race for the Rescues,” held on October 18 was also successful. All 18 dogs taken to the event were adopted.
 - On November 8 and 9, there will be the No-Kill LA adoption weekend. There will be discount adoptions at all six shelters and over 100 shelter animals available at the NKLA adoption mobile, which will be at the Page Museum-La Brea Tar Pits.
 - On November 22 and 23, we will have the “Basic Black” special adoption event. It’ll be \$50 off all adoptions of black and mostly black dogs and cats. This event is sponsored by The Pet Care Foundation.
 - On November 28 through the 30th, we will have a discount adoption weekend for “Black Friday.” Animal Services will be open that Friday; we’re still trying to nail down sponsors.
 - Kitten on Facebook implanted with bad microchip not from LA Shelters. We chip if 8 weeks and adopted. Some are less than 2 pounds (usually 1.5-1.9 pounds). Those are deferred for spay/neuter, but are chipped.
 - WOOFSTAT report for September: live/save rates for cats in all the shelters is down slightly, but more cats coming in; impound for cats are up and dogs are slightly down; live release of cats are down, dogs are up; 4% ahead of where we were this time last year, so on target to get above 70%. Licensing is up by a little over 1,000 (14%) – staff is getting caught up on backlog. Spay/Neuter slightly down, but over 400

Please join us at our website: www.LAAnimalServices.com

animals taken in from hoarding case. Euthanasia down 10%. North Central is highlighted for their accomplishments for the month.

Public Comments:

Daniel Guss: Requested GM Barnette's oral report in writing and that it be posted on website; questioned euthanasia numbers. **Marla Tauscher:** Questioned WoofStat report statistics. **Ady Gil:** Discussed cost of speaker control; said shelters kill even when there is space – mentioned dog "Alladin." **Phyllis Daugharty:** Thanked GM Barnette for saying that Animal Control Officers do the rescues and do the dangerous work; need to get away from rescue organizations rescuing from the shelters; stated that canvassers cannot give administrative citations. **Teri Austin:** Stated that adoptions to the public are down in 4 of 5 shelters; people are not going into shelters. **Whitney Smith:** Addressed GM Barnette's report; asked why volunteers are not able to take dogs out to adoption events; mentioned banner at South L.A. shelter. **Mary Catalano:** Stated that it took two years to put up a banner at the South L.A. shelter; questioned black cat adoptions. **Josh Liddy:** Discussed treatment of volunteers and questioned why they are fired and amount of time volunteers are providing.

4. COMMISSIONERS' ORAL REPORTS AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Commissioner Gross: Thanked attendees and their testimony; spent time with East Valley staff / volunteers in pet adoption booth at Sherman Oaks Street Festival (named staff and several volunteers who participated) and mentioned that half the animals were adopted when he left; stated events are good opportunity, but missing was enough info on spay/neuter and licensing, and the need for better signage; this is a low-cost investment that may pay off.

Commissioner Yañez: Wants an update on the Feline-ality program at Harbor; asked about work release at the shelters; would like to discuss funding formula and bottles, and installation of skylight at "dungeon" instead of segways and boats; stated that Humane Society of U.S. will be funding training for L.A. Animal Control Officers to be led by Todd Stucy, President of the National Animal Control Officers' Association, over two days.

Commissioner Zaft: Thanked attendees and passed on report.

Commissioner Brent: Requested update on volunteer and foster programming; mentioned that hours are down 28% for fiscal year and wants to discuss ways to support volunteers, mentioned LAASEE program.

Public Comments:

Daniel Guss: Would like agenda item to discuss 1.7 million dollars in AWTF and why short on flea meds and food; suggested transferring money to foster program, star program, spay/neuter trust fund, Kuranda beds; asked about Roger's list. **Ady Gil:** Commented Larry's comment about thanking volunteers, but they are not appreciated at shelters; discussed retaliation and that public does not feel welcomed at shelters.

5. DISCUSSION ITEMS [Items take out of order, discussed after item 6B.]

- A.** Status Report on Licensing and Spay/Neuter Outreach Education and Marketing Task Force

Commissioner Zaft provided a summary of the discussion from last May.

GM Barnette: Gave credit to Commissioners and Christal. **Commissioner Brent:** expressed challenges with scheduling meeting time so conference calls were held with Christal and Jan; able to connect with COO of Centinela Feed who will be doing promotion for spay/neuter and licensing in stores and mailers in November; Christal working with representatives on messaging and photos of animal adopted in Los Angeles for outreach; additional brainstorming assistance from volunteer on outreach strategy that will hopefully be implemented at next meeting. **Commissioner Yañez:** has not been able to make meetings. **Commissioner Zaft:** mentioned poster in cat area that reads "That's so LA, waiting to be discovered," and a dog poster that reads something like "If he was licensed, he'd be home by now;" there are messages and media that we can take advantage of to target audiences about spay/neuter and licensing and adoption. **GM Barnette:** indicated staff is taking picture of lobbies to come up with more uniform and attractive signage; working on brochures in English and Spanish; Christal does all the social media and fundraising appeals and marketing, but is only one person, maybe volunteers can help. **Commissioner Zaft:** asked about a vehicle to create a marketing plan for the department and how the Commission can help. **GM Barnette:** responded that people are needed to implement; staff discussing ideas like using pop-up displays to take to street fairs to brand the department; train volunteers in safety driving in order to drive the vehicles to events. **Commissioner Brent:** had innovative ideas from brainstorming, but Christal pulled in many directions; volunteers with marketing or social media expertise are needed; mentioned Pat Kellogg's class with high school students who are great at social media; perhaps Crystal can help manage volunteers. **GM Barnette:** mentioned approval of RFP process to contract with coordinator for quarterly events at the six shelters, but no responses to RFP so still looking for someone to offer that service. **Commissioner Zaft:** asked about next steps. **GM Barnette:** responded the department has an annual calendar that highlights the animal events of the month and there are a lot of materials. **Commissioner Brent:** added the need to look at calendars for availability and that items should be distributed so that not everything falls on Christal; willing to work with other groups or volunteers and can do a lot with very little. **Commissioner Zaft:** suggested discussing issue again later. **Commissioner Brent:** recommended keeping the group small for better coordination; work with Crystal and Jan. **GM Barnette:** offered letter out to current volunteers to find someone with marketing skills to form a committee. **Commissioner Brent:** good opportunity for those not able to make it to a shelter to volunteer. **Commissioner Zaft:** thanked everyone for their time and effort.

Public Comments:

Susan Taylor: shared that spay/neuter is difficult to market; recommended separating spay/neuter from adoption and to talk about other programs so people can learn about the spay/neuter program; also market to/survey city employees. **Teri Austin:** Amanda Foundation; difficult to market spay/neuter; found that Council Offices did not know about voucher program – recommends education about programs and developing one-page description of programs; staff not aware of programs and dept. info dated. **Michael Bell:** Offered services to assist with outreach and marketing – is voice animator and works with producers including Garfield who would be a good representative for spay/neuter; LANE Foundation ad in Spanish about spay/neuter and assistance received lots of response; La Opinion Saturday full page ad in color costs \$5,000; reach out before they get to shelter. **Tracy James:** Volunteer; people have expressed that it's a cultural difference with Spanish people not growing up knowing of health benefits (Commissioner Yanez clarified it's economics); posters showing how number of breeding works best; volunteers are not notified of events; suggests online resource. **Whitney Smith:** City Council not helping

with outreach and marketing – booths at events too expensive and don't include small independent rescues, no coordination with LAAS, can use discretionary funds. **Steven Latham:** Shelter Me; public doesn't know where shelters are; background in marketing and available to help; earmark money for bilingual radio spots/billboards; market shelters; positive messaging, shelterme.com to help adopt animals; not doing education - bring kids to shelters – has curriculum that can be used. **Josh Liddy:** use volunteers; one person should not be in charge of all facets of networking; volunteer suggestions are ignored; comments about retaliation against volunteers. **Sherry Brewer:** Use yards at shelters for adoption events – volunteers can help socialize dogs, bring out all dogs to get exercise and bring people into shelters; designed bumper stickers for people when they adopt to advertise shelter.

Commissioner Brent: invited ideas be emailed to her at neuterspay@outlook.com. **Commissioner Zaft:** thanked everyone for great ideas, and Steven Latham and Michael Bell for joining the committee; marketing of quarterly adoption events, example Texas' Empty the Shelter Days.

B. Discussion re Status of Reserve Animal Control Officer ("RACO") Program

GM Barnette provided background report on RACO program; trying to get enough people for a class, currently only three qualified RACO applicants listed with City Services who have completed the required 54 hours of paid or unpaid work at one of the city shelters; there are nine RACOs in the department who are not active due to union issue of working out of class, but found a simple solution by having them complete the RACO volunteer hours at a different shelter; last step for completion is a personal background check and may be referred for medical or psychological evaluation since they have access to firearms; department has a training officer and there is money to do two classes of 15; RACO provided ACTs opportunity for promotion to Animal Control Officers (ACOs), but city has current hiring freeze so can't hire more ACOs, which encourages more volunteers for RACO; willing to look at other types of volunteers programs that would allow working with ACOs.

Commissioner Zaft: thanked GM for information related to nine volunteer RACOs and ability to resume RACO duties; not enough Officers and we will be going to City Council for more positions in next fiscal year; RACO support work of Officers is very valuable; suggested lack of applicants may be due to not being able to be placed in RACO duties. **GM Barnette:** clarified the issue affected volunteers from within the city, not volunteers outside of the city.

Commissioner Zaft mentioned issue came up at East Valley meeting in February and gave Paul Darrigo time for a video presentation.

Paul Darrigo showed marketing video on RACO program.

Commissioner Zaft clarified that LAAS did not put together the PSA.

Paul Darrigo: film maker with BS degree in technical management and associate degree in marketing, works at Disney as IT specialist, completed PMP training and will be certified in project management; RACO since 2009 and here on behalf of 26 Neighborhood Councils who represent almost 1 million residents in L.A.; questioned why largest animal shelter in the country serving almost 4 million people does not have a

Please join us at our website: www.LAAnimalservices.com

volunteer animal control officer program; RACOs do same work as full-time paid ACOs and are needed because ACOs are stretched thin.

Paul Darrigo showed a second marketing video on RACO program.

Paul Darrigo went through PowerPoint on RACO program and commented on staffing from 2009 and 2010; erroneous labor law information that took RACOs off schedule for a year and department conducted no outreach on program; labor law applied only to ACTs so program closed down for nothing; raised \$30,000 from NCs and AWTF is available; limited outreach from city website; met with several from City Attorney's office and no one directed department stop RACO program, and, after program restarted, GM Barnette said it was her decision; conducted outreach and referred interested to department, but never contacted; asked to stop raising money.

Paul Darrigo showed part of a third marketing video on RACO program.

Paul Darrigo: suggested setting priorities and performance goals such as case closure rates, phone response times, increasing license renewal; successful RACO program answer to successful outreach – outreach to schools, newsletter, webpage.

Commissioner Brent: commented on conversation with officer during ride along who expressed support for RACO program and assistance helpful; department is moving in direction to reconstitute program. **GM Barnette:** asked Paul to stop raising money until able to recruit more students; would like a video with footage of L.A. Officers like SMART action for promotional video; currently three qualified applicants and need 15 for a class. **Commissioner Brent:** asked about qualifications needed. **GM Barnette:** able to lift 70 lbs, complete 54 hours of volunteer time to become familiar with department, be 21 years of age, 6 month course of two sessions a week - one weekday evening and Saturday; learn all the ordinances and related laws, trained on firearms and are approved by LAPD – they are full Officers at the end of the training, only they are volunteers. **Commissioner Zafft:** program would be tremendous if it can work; ability to leverage trained volunteers would be godsend. **Commissioner Brent:** another way to do targeted volunteer outreach as a job listing for people who want to work in animal services. **GM Barnette:** perhaps can be advertised in other places because position is advertised by Personnel as a job, but not for pay. **Commissioner Brent:** added advertising on idealist. **Commissioner Zafft:** added advertising at our shelters; if volunteering, not sure people would go to Personnel website. **GM Barnette:** added that going through Personnel is the process, but advertising elsewhere can direct people to Personnel.

Public Comments

Jay Beeber: 2nd Vice President of the Sherman Oaks NC – one of the NCs that donated money for RACO program; questioned what happened to program and why not going forward, but happy moving forward (thanked Paul); suggested mindset of “no” keeping department from finding sufficient volunteers. **Phyllis Daugherty:** How she got started as volunteer Officer in another state; very difficult and dangerous; program in CA is too litigious - Hayden bill, trying to enforce laws pre-seizure, post-seizure, deciding what is an exigent circumstance; currently Humane Officer - thankless and dangerous job; officers being shot – mentioned Sacramento Officer; suggested gearing it down to assisting officers; County has contract that allows ACTs to serve as ACOs at night, but not full officer duty; should provide assistance only - no back-up. **Fran Reichenbach:** City has lots of things on website; suggested use of own website and include email addresses for

leaders. **Michael Bell:** likes concept of “yes”; person who started Latino animal welfare program was able to find resources; video shot in SLA – numbers are down because animals not being picked-up. **Marla Tauscher:** as long as officers are trained, program can work; mentioned own case with dangerous dog hearing; already using community volunteers that call themselves independent officers – department will be liable for them.

Commissioner Zaft: mentioned question raised by Commissioner Brent and finding ways to recruit volunteers.

Paul Darrigo: suggested need for comprehensive marketing plan (mentioned Apple).

6. BOARD REPORTS

- A. Animal Welfare Trust and Animal Sterilization Fund Balances (including Breakout of Private Veterinarian Amounts) [Continued to next meeting]
- B. One-Year Agreements for the Operations of the Harbor and West Los Angeles Spay/Neuter Clinics (Action Required) [Discussed after Item 4]

AGM John Chavez provided a summary of the written report and mentioned need for approval at tonight's meeting due to PAW Committee's available meeting dates.

Commissioner Yañez: Asked for clarification of monthly goal for each vet clinic and why dept. thought they were underperforming, and which animals are included. **AGM Chavez:** Referred to WoofStat report and contractual goal and clarified only working days and number of shelter animals provided for sterilization are counted. **GM Barnette:** Added that it is only shelter animals and that if they are already spayed or neutered, it is easier to get them adopted; veterinarians were not hired to do sterilizations primarily, but it is the department's focus in order to get animals out, and it saves money in sterilization fund for public; clinics use city facilities and do spay/neuters at voucher price. **AGM Chavez:** Clarified that Value Vet contract is a hybrid to do 20 per day, shelter and public, but in this agreement only shelter animals will be counted. **Commissioner Yañez:** Asked why it falls short from the shelter. **GM Barnette:** Responded that many of the smaller shelters get animals already spayed/neutered; they need to be healthy and staff needs to get them over to the clinic in the morning; making adjustments to ensure we are providing sufficient animals in order to reach goal. **AGM Chavez:** Stated department is now getting a daily report as to the number of animals sent for sterilization; any rejections will be questioned, monthly reports will be compiled, and there will be regular monitoring. **Commissioner Gross:** Asked if numbers of these two clinics are lower than other clinics. **AGM Chavez:** WoofStat report shows maximum numbers and not actual number of animals sent over; the next month it will be revised to show number of animals sent over and the number of sterilizations done; internal analysis shows they are performing; stats are not as refined as they need to be. **GM Barnette:** Added they are 1-year contracts. **Commissioner Gross:** Asked if only these two bid and what happens if they are not approved. **Commissioner Yañez:** Responded clinics are being recommended because they are performing; if not approved, sterilizations will need to be done internally and additional funding will be needed. **Commissioner Yañez:** Asked if both clinics are on site. **AGM Chavez:** Responded affirmatively. **Commissioner Zaft:** Pointed out that both contracts have a requirement for low cost vaccines and spay/neuter event once per month; asked if we know how well working. **AGM Chavez and GM Barnette:** Responded that department has not yet monitored that. **Commissioner Yañez:** Stated

that she would like to see two per month. **AGM Chavez:** Noted that it is a draft agreement and only the starting point; upon approval the department begins negotiations. **GM Barnette:** Adding that adding a low cost vaccine clinic would draw in spay/neuter clients. **Commissioner Yañez:** Agreed and added that she refers clients for reduced cost vaccine, but if they miss the day of they have to wait a whole month. **AGM Chavez:** Mentioned ASPCA agreement, which is still in process going to PAW Committee, and department recommendation of SNP LA to do low cost vaccine clinics so these organizations cannot compete with them. **GM Barnette:** Mentioned ASPCA wellness clinics. **Commissioner Yañez:** Stated they are at the South L.A. shelter and questioned where is the competition. **AGM Chavez:** Clarified that SNP LA. is going to all shelters; ASPCA cannot do clinics in the South L.A. shelter area. **Commissioner Yañez:** Mentioned ASPCA will likely conduct clinics in a park.

Public Comment

Susan Taylor: Asked about Value Vet and their clinic across the street, the affordability of low-cost spay/neuter. **Teri Austin:** Asked Commission to pay attention to the number of shelter animals that are being outsourced; shelter vet is more expensive. **Barbara Trelease:** Volunteer with rabbits at shelter; asked if performance is numbers; problem at West LA - drive rabbits to Harbor because problem with survival rate; Snip LA is doing well because always have wait. **Ady Gil:** Doesn't understand how spay/neuter works; gets vouchers and able to use them at any vet that accepts it; asked why are contracts needed.

Commissioner Zaft: Asked Value Vet representative if clinic across the street is still in operation. **Valley Vet CEO, Ed McCobb:** Responded that they no longer have that clinic. **Commissioner Yañez:** Asked about price and whether they accept the voucher; and about other related costs. **CEO McCobb:** Responded that they accept all vouchers and provide antibiotics, pain meds and e-collar. **Commissioner Yañez:** Asked if second low-cost vaccine clinic can be provided. **CEO McCobb:** Stated that they are low-cost is provided every day. **Commissioner Yañez:** Asked about the one-day event held at North Central. **AGM Chavez:** Responded that it was SCVVC. **Commissioner Zaft:** Read that the contract indicates that the contractor will host one low cost spay/neuter clinic will every month and one low-cost vaccination clinic every Sunday. **CEO McCobb:** Responded they have increased the low-cost vaccines to every day and spay/neuter special to twice per month. **Commissioner Yañez:** Requested the agreement wording reflect what was stated.

Commissioner Gross made a motion to approve both contracts. Commissioner Yañez offered a friendly amendment that the agreement state that low-cost vaccines will be provided every day and low-cost spay/neuter clinics be held twice a month. Commission Gross accepted and Commissioner Yañez seconded the motion. The vote was 3 – 0 in favor.

- C. Recommendations Related to Walking, Socializing and Fostering Evidence Animals, "Possible Owner" Dogs, Dangerous Animals, Stray Dogs, Quarantined Dogs, Personal Property Dogs, Dogs on a 45-Day Hold for Public Adoption (Aggressive Behavior), Disaster-Held Dogs, and Dogs on a 45-Day Hold for Public Adoption (Excessive Barking) and Changes to Personal Property Holding Times. (Continued from October 14, 2014; Action required) [Item taken out of order, discussed after 5B]

GM Barnette discussed report and indicated no problem with handling of any shelter

dogs, except for dangerous dogs, within shelter walls, and in some cases it would be up to the DFOs they may not have information on particular case and need to contact other staff or District Attorney.

Commissioner Yañez: challenge understanding recommendation; regarding holding time from 30 down to 20 days, would like to reduce to 15 days. **GM Barnette:** responded need to provide sufficient notice due to city's mail USPS service. [Discussion on process of city's mail services – all city mail goes through General Services, supply of postage not kept because like money and needs to be accounted for] **Commissioner Yañez:** has experience with people who are sick or incarcerated and who plan for it and make arrangements for animals; feels that middle-of-the-night drug busts leave animals and don't come back for them; will not vote on 20 days for personal property dogs; requested change in wording for #1 that all animals can be exercised on shelter grounds except for dangerous dogs. **Commissioner Zaft:** indicated confusion because section reads "these animals should never be walked by anyone other than staff," but what is meant is "off the property," under "Evidence Dog" item 1 on page 2. **Commissioner Gross:** seems to be a logistic issue; offered compromise from 31 days to no more than 15 to 20 days. **Commissioner Zaft:** believes the hold period has to be a fixed period. **Commissioner Yañez:** responded that people who legitimately need to find a place for animals will do so; or they don't come back or are dead. **Commissioner Gross:** the issue is whether they can get the mail out with sufficient time. **Commissioner Yañez:** asked about the longest it would take for someone to mail from the city. **GM Barnette:** responded that department can't answer for GSD because it depends on their work load (they have to sort it and post it and have times that are busier); **AGM Chavez:** added that we usually factor in 3-5 days to get the mail out. **Commissioner Yañez:** responded that 15 days provides enough time. **Commissioner Zaft:** disagreed and feels that moving from 30 to 20 days is a good move – there are situations where some people may need the time to get their act together. **Commissioner Brent:** asked about allow certain volunteers to handle some of the more challenging dogs (mentioned Best Friends' practice to differentiate between new and more experienced volunteers). **GM Barnette:** mentioned class that will be provided and socialization program will include retraining all volunteers and staff on how to handle dogs. **Commissioner Brent:** mature volunteers may not be best suited to walk more exuberant dogs; would like to follow-up in two meetings about class implementation. **GM Barnette:** hopes to report in two meetings that the class has started. **Commissioner Gross:** fine with 20 days – it's a reality with the city; less time may create problems for city.

Public Comments:

Ady Gil: concerned with dogs that can only be walked by staff because has hardly ever seen staff walking dogs, volunteers do, but they don't want to go to shelter because feel uncomfortable; maybe law is not very clear. **Marla Tauscher:** law is clear on this issue; has offered to teach a class, but told it would not work; cited CA penal code §597(t) related to confined dogs and need to exercise - no exceptions for shelter dogs or evidence; questioned reasons behind evidence dogs; misdemeanor to keep them confined without exercise; dogs identified as dangerous have not been adjudicated - get qualified person to walk dogs; suggested using phone calls rather than written notices. **Josh Liddy:** Volunteers should walk all the dogs; dangerous dogs are unjustly confiscated – dangerous dog label is over-inclusive (provided scenario of dog involved in accident). **Diane De Stefano:** Thanked change to 15 days instead of 20; ACTs do not walk dogs – don't have time and need to include volunteers. **Billie Baier:** asked if a volunteer can walk evidence dog within shelter tomorrow and whether stray dogs are

included (Brenda – clarified Commission needs to take action first and policy needs to be written and provided to staff, and that it includes everything, within shelter walls, except dangerous dogs). **Michelle Cornelius:** holds possible owner dogs for only seven days after letter goes out.

Commissioner Zaft: feels sense of urgency because some evidence dogs have been here since May, but policy does not say what staff is saying (read from “Personal Property Dogs”) – volunteers would not be able to take personal property dogs out within the 15 or 20 day holding period. **AGM Chavez:** indicated that any exceptions would be the decision of the Director of Shelter Operations. **Commissioner Zaft:** clarified that the rule would be that they cannot be walked. **AGM Chavez:** responded affirmatively. **Commissioner Yañez:** would like to change motion to read “all animals can be walked on property except dangerous dogs, and #2 change to under 20 to 18, 17... **Commissioner Zaft:** suggested tabling item and it be brought back with clearer recommendation – policy as written is not clear and does not say what you think it says. **Commissioner Yañez:** asked if report can be rewritten so it reads “everyone can be walked except dangerous dogs.” **AGM Chavez:** noted exception includes quarantined dogs. **Commissioner Yañez:** asked it be written so that it is flipped – everyone can be walked instead of no one can be walked. **AGM Chavez:** responded that what was changed was making assumption that dogs could be walked unless the City Attorney directed against it, but allowed Director of Operations to make determination. **Commissioner Zaft:** recommended allowing staff to make changes and bring it back. **Commissioner Gross:** recommended making specific changes at meeting since next meeting is in a month. **GM Barnette:** suggested taking Alana’s motion and saying “by trained volunteers for everything except dangerous and quarantined,” it would be good.

Commissioner Zaft: offered a substitute motion to approve the recommendation, but clarify that the rule is that all dogs except dangerous and quarantined dogs may be walked by trained volunteers on shelter property unless there is an exception ordered by the Director of Shelter Operations or the City Attorney. **Commissioner Brent:** clarified that includes dogs that are beyond their stray hold can be walked off shelter property (GM Barnette clarified that past stray hold dogs are just like shelter dogs). **Commissioner Gross:** asked if comfortable with 18 days. **GM Barnette:** offered consideration whether evidence dogs, even dangerous dogs (unless unsafe to handle), can get taken out by staff to respond to humane care issue. **Commissioner Yañez:** reiterated that trained volunteers can walk all dogs except quarantined and dangerous dogs, and staff can take out dangerous dogs and quarantined dogs to walk on property. **GM Barnette:** stated department is responsible if dog bites someone else or tips dog to be categorized as dangerous. **Commissioner Zaft:** indicated substitute motion too complicated and asked staff to take comments and come back with motion that can be approved at next meeting. (Commissioners interjected that next meeting is in a month and motion can be amended)

Commissioner Zaft made a substitute motion to approve the recommendation, but with the change that the rule is all dogs except dangerous animals and quarantined dogs may be walked on shelter property by trained volunteers, and there will only be exceptions to the rule if ordered by the Director of Shelter Operations, the City Attorney, or the District Attorney; that, with dangerous and quarantined animals, staff must get them out once a day unless the dog is too dangerous; [discussion ensued regarding holding time for personal property dogs; DCA Gonzales-Kimbrough interjected that USPS also has processing timeframes and it is a due process issue, so courier services are used, which is cost prohibitive for department]; and accept staff recommendation to shorten

notification time from 30 to 20 days for personal property dogs. **Commission Brent** seconded. The vote was 3 – 1 in favor.

DCA Gonzales-Kimbrough: Recommended that directive (SOP) be written so that each category of animal list what can be done with that category of animal, rather than using a blanket statement – go step-by-step by category. **Commissioner Zaft:** agreed with format recommendation and clarified abbreviated format was for motion language only. **Commissioner Yañez:** indicated that she thought there would be two separate motions and asked for reconsideration. **Commissioner Zaft:** clarified that only those on winning side can ask for reconsideration.

7. ADJOURNMENT

AGM Chavez reminded everyone that November 11th is a holiday (no meeting) and asked if all commissioners would be present for the November 25, 2014 meeting in City Hall, at 10:00 a.m. All Commissioners present said they would be available. Commissioner Zaft asked that schedule on website be updated to reflect December 9 off-site meeting; and if everyone will be present at last meeting of the year (responses in the affirmative). **Commissioner Gross** motioned to adjourn the meeting and **Commissioner Yañez** seconded. Motion carried 4-0. Meeting ended at 10:36 p.m.