



BOARD OF ANIMAL SERVICES COMMISSIONERS  
CITY OF LOS ANGELES

**REGULAR MEETING AGENDA**  
**Tuesday, October 11, 2016**  
**10:00 A.M.**

LOS ANGELES CITY HALL, ROOM 1060  
200 NORTH SPRING STREET  
LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90012

---

DAVID ZAFT  
President

LARRY GROSS  
Vice-President

OLIVIA E. GARCÍA  
ROGER WOLFSON  
(VACANT)

Sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or other auxiliary aids and/or services may be provided upon request. To ensure availability, you are advised to make your request at least 72 hours prior to the meeting you wish to attend. For information please call (213) 482-9558.

Si requiere servicios de traducción, favor de hacer pedido con 24 horas de anticipo al (213) 482-9558.

**I. ADMINISTRATIVE APPEALS**

**1. Dangerous Animal Revocation Case: DR 162143 EV**

Respondent: Doris McClerkin and Malvin McClerkin  
East Valley Animal Care and Control: Captain Karen Knipscheer-Cox  
Complaining Witness: Alma Guerrero

**2. Dangerous Animal Revocation Case: DR 156018 EV**

Respondent: Anthony Rey Lopez and Michelle Lee Oliveros Rey  
East Valley Animal Care and Control: Captain Karen Knipscheer-Cox  
Complaining Witness: East Valley Animal Care and Control

## **II. REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING**

- 1. PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD** - (Comments from the public on items of public interest within the Board's subject matter jurisdiction that are not on the Agenda; two minutes per speaker.)

Public Comments: The Brown Act prohibits the Board and staff from responding to the speakers' comments. Some of the matters raised in public comment may appear on a future agenda.

- 2. NEIGHBORHOOD COUNCIL COMMENTS** - (Discussion with Neighborhood Council representatives on Neighborhood Council Resolutions or Community Impact Statements filed with the City Clerk which relate to any agenda item listed or being considered on this agenda for the Board of Animal Services Commissioners)

### **3. COMMISSION BUSINESS**

- A. Approval of the Minutes for Meeting of September 27, 2016 (Action Item; Public comment limited to one minute per speaker):

- 4. ORAL REPORT OF THE GENERAL MANAGER** (Public comment limited to one minute per speaker.)

- 5. COMMISSIONERS' ORAL REPORTS AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS** (Public comment limited to one minute per speaker)

### **6. BOARD REPORTS**

- A. Staff Report Requesting approval to amend the Requirements to obtain a license and microchip. (Action Item; Public comment limited to two minutes per speaker):
- B. Staff Report Requesting approval for the use of Animal Welfare Trust Funds monies to cover the additional costs associated with retrofitting space at our West Los Angeles and Harbor Facilities. (Action Item; Public comment limited to two minutes per speaker):
- C. Oral Staff Report on Kapparot (Public comment limited to one minute per speaker):
- D. Oral Staff Report on Strategy for Responding to Current Influx of Kittens (Public comment limited to one minute per speaker):

### **7. DISCUSSION ITEMS**

### **8. ADJOURNMENT**

Next Regular Meeting is scheduled for 7:00 p.m. October 25, 2016, at The West Los Angeles Shelter, 11361 W. Pico Blvd, Los Angeles, California 90064.

**AGENDAS** - The Board of Animal Services Commissioners (Board) meets regularly every second (2<sup>nd</sup>) and fourth (4<sup>th</sup>) Tuesday of each month at 10:00 A.M. Regular Meetings are held at City Hall, 200 North Spring Street, Room 1060, in Los Angeles, CA 90012. Evening Meetings are held in various locations throughout the City, from 7:00 to approximately 9:30 P.M. The agendas for Board meetings contain a brief general description of those items to be considered at the meetings. Board Agendas are available at the Department of Animal Services (Department), Administrative Division, 221 North Figueroa Street, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor, Suite 600, Los Angeles, CA 90012. Board Agendas may also be viewed on the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor Public Bulletin Board in City Hall East, 200 North Main Street, Los Angeles, CA 90012. Internet users may also access copies of present and prior agenda items, copies of the Board Calendar, MP-3 audio files of meetings as well as electronic copies of approved minutes on the Department's World Wide Web Home Page site at <http://www.laanimalservices.com/CommissionAgendas.htm>

Three (3) members of the Board constitute a quorum for the transaction of business. Some items on the Agenda may be approved without any discussion.

The Board Secretary will announce the items to be considered by the Board. The Board will hear the presentation on the topic and gather additional information from Department Staff. Once presentations have finished, the Board President will ask if any Board Member or member of the public wishes to speak on one or more of these items. Each speaker called before the Commission will have one (1) minute to express their comments and concerns on matters placed on the agenda. (For certain agenda items, speakers will have two (2) minutes.)

**PUBLIC INPUT AT BOARD MEETINGS – Public Participation on Agenda Items.** Members of the public will have an opportunity to address the Board on agenda items after the item is called and before the Board takes action on the item, unless the opportunity for public participation on the item was previously provided to all interested members of the public at a public meeting of a Committee of the Board and the item has not substantially changed since the Committee heard the item. When speaking to an agenda item other than during Public Comment (see Public Comment below), the speaker shall limit his or her comments to the specific item under consideration (California Government Code, Section 54954.3).

**Public Comment.** The Board will provide an opportunity for public comment at every regular meeting of the Board. Members of the public may address the Board on any items within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Board as part of Public Comment.

**Speaker Cards.** Members of the public wishing to speak are to fill out one speaker card for each agenda item on which they wish to speak and present it to the Board secretary before the item is called.

**Time Limit for Speakers.** Speakers addressing the Board will be limited to one (1) minute of speaking time for each agenda item except during general public comment period which is limited to two (2) minutes per speaker. (For certain agenda items, speakers will have two (2) minutes each.). The Chairperson, with the approval of a majority of the Board, may for good cause extend any speaker's time by increments of up to one (1) minute.

**Brown Act.** These rules shall be interpreted in a manner that is consistent with the Ralph M. Brown Act, California Government Code Section § 54950 et seq.

**STANDARDS OF CONDUCT.** Speakers are expected to behave in an orderly manner and to refrain from personal attacks or use of profanity or language that may incite violence.

All persons present at Board meetings are expected to behave in an orderly manner and to refrain from disrupting the meeting, interfering with the rights of others to address the Board and/or interfering with the conduct of business by the Board.

In the event that any speaker does not comply with the foregoing requirements, or if a speaker does not address the specific item under consideration, the speaker may be ruled out of order, their speaking time forfeited and the Chairperson may call upon the next speaker.

The Board, by majority vote, may order the removal from the meeting of any speaker or audience member continuing to behave in a disruptive manner after being warned by the Chairperson regarding their behavior. Section 403 of the California Penal Code states as follows: "Every person who, without authority of law, willfully disturbs or breaks up any assembly or meeting that is not unlawful in its character, other than an assembly or meeting referred to in Section 302 of the Penal Code or Section 18340 of the Elections Code, is guilty of a misdemeanor."

**VOTING AND DISPOSITION OF ITEMS** – Most items require a majority vote of the entire membership of the Board (3 members). When debate on an item is completed, the Board President will instruct the Secretary to "call the roll". Every member present must vote for or against each item; abstentions are not permitted unless there is a Conflict of Interest for which the Board member is obliged to abstain from voting. The Secretary will announce the votes on each item. Any member of the Board may move to "reconsider" any vote on any item on the agenda, except to adjourn, suspend the Rules, or where an intervening event has deprived the Board of jurisdiction, providing that said member originally voted on the prevailing side of the item. The motion to "reconsider" shall only be in order once during the meeting, and once during the next regular meeting. The member requesting reconsideration shall identify for all members present the Agenda number and subject matter previously voted upon. A motion to reconsider is not debatable and shall require an affirmative vote of three members of the Board.

When the Board has failed by sufficient votes to approve or reject an item, and has not lost jurisdiction over the matter, or has not caused it to be continued beyond the next regular meeting, the issue is again placed on the next agenda for the following meeting for the purpose of allowing the Board to again vote on the matter.

**BOARD OF  
ANIMAL SERVICES  
COMMISSIONERS**

DAVID ZAFT  
PRESIDENT

LARRY GROSS  
VICE PRESIDENT

COMMISSIONERS

OLIVIA E. GARCÍA

ROGER WOLFSON

VACANT

# City of Los Angeles

CALIFORNIA



**ERIC GARCETTI  
MAYOR**

**DEPARTMENT OF  
ANIMAL SERVICES**  
221 North Figueroa Street  
6<sup>th</sup> Floor, Suite 600  
Los Angeles, CA 90012

(888) 452-7381  
FAX (213) 482-9511

BRENDA F. BARNETTE  
GENERAL MANAGER

DANA H. BROWN  
ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER

VACANT  
ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER

## NOTIFICATION OF ADMINISTRATIVE APPEAL HEARINGS

**To Be Held:  
Tuesday, October 11, 2016, at 10:00 A.M.**

**City Hall  
200 North Spring Street, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor, Room 1060  
Los Angeles, CA 90012  
(Entrance on Main Street)**

This serves as formal notice pursuant to Section § 53.18(q) 4 of the Los Angeles Municipal Code (LAMC) to the following parties and witnesses in the appeal(s) listed below:

- 1. Dangerous Animal Revocation Case: DR 162143 EV**  
Respondent: Doris McClerkin and Malvin McClerkin  
East Valley Animal Care and Control: Captain Karen Knipscheer-Cox  
Complaining Witness: Alma Guerrero
- 2. Dangerous Animal Revocation Case: DR 156018 EV**  
Respondent: Anthony Rey Lopez and Michelle Lee Oliveros Rey  
East Valley Animal Care and Control: Captain Karen Knipscheer-Cox  
Complaining Witness: East Valley Animal Care and Control

These hearings will not be rescheduled, except for good cause.

As a covered entity under Title II of the Americans with Disabilities Act, the City of Los Angeles does not discriminate on the basis of disability and, upon request, will provide reasonable accommodation to ensure equal access to its programs, services and activities. Sign Language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or other auxiliary aids and/or services may be provided upon request. To ensure availability, you are advised to make your request at least 72 hours prior to the meeting you wish to attend.

For additional information, please refer to the Board's "Rules and Procedures for Appeals", or contact the Department of Animal Services at (213) 482-9558, or visit the Department's website: <http://www.laanimalservices.com/>. Written statements are to be submitted to the Commission seven days prior and, if in excess of 50 pages, seven hard copies must be provided. You may submit your statement (50 pages or less) via email to: [ani.commission@lacity.org](mailto:ani.commission@lacity.org).

*Para información en español, llame al (213) 482-9558.*

"Creating a Humane LA"

**AN EQUAL OPPORTUNITY EMPLOYER**

Visit our website at [www.LAAnimalServices.com](http://www.LAAnimalServices.com)

DAVID ZAFT  
PRESIDENT

LARRY GROSS  
VICE PRESIDENT

COMMISSIONERS

OLIVIA GARCIA

ROGER WOLFSON

VACANT



ERIC GARCETTI  
MAYOR

221 N. Figueroa Street, Room 600  
Los Angeles, CA 90012

(888) 452-7381  
FAX (213) 482-9511

BRENDA F. BARNETTE  
GENERAL MANAGER

DANA H. BROWN  
ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER

VACANT  
ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER

## Report to the Board of Animal Services Commissioners

**COMMISSION MEETING DATE:** October 11, 2016

**PREPARED BY:** Dana Brown

**REPORT DATE:** October 6, 2016

**TITLE:** Assistant General Manager

**SUBJECT:** CHANGE IN POLICY REGARDING THE ISSUANCE OF LICENSES AND MICROCHIPS TO HOMELESS PET OWNERS

### BOARD ACTIONS RECOMMENDED:

1. APPROVE a change in the policy for issuing dog licenses to allow email addresses only for homeless pet owners with no physical mailing address.
2. APPROVE a change in the policy for issuing microchips to allow email addresses only for homeless pet owners with no physical mailing address.

### BACKGROUND:

The City of Los Angeles has a Comprehensive Homeless Strategy (CHS) focused at assisting homeless individuals in the City of Los Angeles with services provided by the City. Each strategy has a lead agency that is responsible for ensuring that all elements of the strategy are met and executed. The Department of Animal Services is the lead agency on two (2) CHS strategies. One of which is Strategy 9H entitled Proposal to Assist Homeless Individuals and Their Pets. (see attached) This strategy is made up of seven actions all of which assist homeless pet owners. One of those seven actions is to change the current policy/procedure for issuing dog licenses and microchips and allowing email addresses for those homeless individuals with no physical mailing address.

### SUMMARY:

The Department uses the USPS to notify licensed pet owners of expired licenses and vaccine certificates and allows licensees to renew by mail as well as on-line. Currently in order to buy a license, a physical address must be provided. While there are some homeless pet owners who do have access to a physical address for receiving mail, many of them do not and are therefore ineligible to license an animal in the City of Los Angeles. Similarly, physical addresses are currently required to purchase and register microchips. In an effort to assist homeless pet owners with responsible pet ownership, it is recommended that the requirement of a physical

"Creating a Humane LA"

AN EQUAL OPPORTUNITY EMPLOYER

Visit our website at [www.LAAnimalServices.com](http://www.LAAnimalServices.com)

address be waived for homeless individuals and an email address allowed instead. In these cases the Department can send renewal information via email and the pet owner can use the on-line option to renew the license. Alternately, after having receive the email notification of the renewal, the pet owner can come into any animal shelter and renew.

In the case of microchips, emails addresses and phone numbers are required by the microchip registry for proper registration. Upon approval of this proposal, the Department will reach out to representatives of Found Animals to determine how to facilitate "email only" microchip registrations.

The City of Los Angeles Public Library system provides free internet usage for patrons. Likewise there are a number of free email service providers available for those interested in their services. It should be noted that it is not the intent of this proposal to waive the physical address requirement for all pet owners, but rather to create an operational tool that allows homeless pet owners an opportunity to license and register their companion animals in the spirit of the City's CHS.

**FISCAL IMPACT:**

There is no direct fiscal impact to the General Fund, Animal Sterilization Fund, or the Animal Welfare Trust Fund.

Approved:

\_\_\_\_\_

**Brenda Barnette, General Manager**

Attachment

---

**BOARD ACTION:**

\_\_\_\_\_ Passed  
\_\_\_\_\_ Passed with noted modifications  
\_\_\_\_\_ Tabled

Disapproved \_\_\_\_\_  
Continued \_\_\_\_\_  
New Date \_\_\_\_\_



## Additional Strategies

### Proposals to Assist Homeless Individuals and Their Pets

**Population Impact:** ☒ All ☐ Families ☐ TAY ☐ Single Adult ☐ Veteran ☐ Chronically Homeless Adult

#### Recommendation:

Instruct the Department of Animal Services (Animal Services) to report relative to the following proposals to assist homeless individuals with pets or pet owners at-risk of homelessness: tethering law amendment; expansion of spay/neuter surgeries; licensing and microchipping; temporary housing for pets in danger of relinquishment; developing pet services programs; and providing free vaccine clinics.

#### Description:

Below is a series of actions the Department of Animal Services (Animal Services) should investigate to ensure homeless individuals and their pets, and pet owners at-risk of homelessness are provided assistance to address or prevent homelessness.

##### 1. Tethering Law

Currently, Municipal Code 53.70 only allows a dog owner to tether their pet to a pole or tree to complete temporary tasks, while the pet remains under supervision. Animal Services advises that State law allows tethering up to three hours within a 24 hour period, and therefore aligning City policy with State law would allow all dog owners, including homeless dog owners, more leniency to secure their animals.

##### 2. Expansion of Spay/Neuter Services

The department advises that the Board of Animal Services Commissioners will be considering a proposal to reduce requirements imposed on pet owners to obtain free spay/neuter surgeries for their animals. Currently, the department requires proof of low-income status through a W2 or a pay stub. Animal Services is proposing to eliminate this requirement, which would eliminate a barrier for homeless individuals to receive the service.

##### 3. Licensing and Microchipping

Currently, Animal Services' policy requires animal licenses and microchipping to be processed with a physical address. The address is used to send out renewal notices and to stay in contact with residents receiving department services. The department advises it is considering amending the requirement to allow email addresses to suffice for processing licensing and microchipping services. This policy change would allow homeless individuals without a physical mailing address to receive animal licenses and microchips for their pets.

##### 4. Temporary Housing for Pets in Danger of Relinquishment

Downtown Dog Rescue (DDR) is a non-profit animal service organization which operates part-time from the City's South Los Angeles Shelter. DDR provides a variety of services to its clients including the following: supplying dog bowls, dog leashes and dog food; spay/neuter vouchers; and funding to cover the costs of minor surgeries for animals. DDR advises that many of the clients they serve are homeless or on the verge of homelessness and the costs of redeeming a dog from impound, which can exceed \$350, or even purchasing a \$20 animal license fee can be too costly for someone whose housing status is in jeopardy. As a result, the Department should investigate the possibility of securing temporary shelter for the pets of homeless individuals so that those individuals do not have to relinquish their animals while the factors causing housing and financial instability are addressed.

##### 5. and 6. Pet Services Programs

DDR has offered to staff a pet services clinic in the Skid Row area of downtown for approximately half a day a week, if the City can provide the office space. City staff should investigate the possibility of providing office space in the downtown area.



In addition, DDR has established a Shelter Intervention Program (SIP) to train other providers how to establish and operate an animal services program similar to DDR. The City should determine if a SIP can be established in other areas of the City, including at other City shelters to serve homeless individuals with pets or pet owners at risk of homelessness.

**7. Determine feasibility of Free Vaccine Clinics**

Currently, Animal Services does not operate free vaccine clinics in the City, however, the department does have a contract for a low-cost vaccine clinic. The Department has advised it could determine the feasibility of providing a free vaccine clinic accessible to homeless individuals.

**Coordinated Response Type:**

Supportive Services

**Population(s) Targeted/Other Categorizations:**

Homeless individuals with pets and pet owners at-risk of homelessness.

**Potential Performance Metrics:**

Statistics for increased spay/neuter surgeries, license renewals, microchipping, and vaccines provided to homeless individuals with pets, as well as the establishment of service programs at locations throughout the City.

**Potential Funding Source:**

NA

**Implementation Time Frame:**

Short-Term

**Lead Agency:**

Department of Animal Services

**Collaborating Departments/Agencies:**

Los Angeles Homeless Services Authority (LAHSA)  
Department of General Services (GSD)  
City Administrative Officer (CAO)

**Connection to County:** ☐ Integrate ☐ Support ☒ No Relation



BOARD OF ANIMAL SERVICES COMMISSIONERS  
CITY OF LOS ANGELES



MINUTES

TUESDAY, September 27, 2016 at 10:00 AM

LOS ANGELES CITY HALL, ROOM 1060  
200 NORTH SPRING STREET  
LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90012

---

Audio MP-3 Recording is available at [www.laanimalservices.com](http://www.laanimalservices.com)

---

David Zaft, President  
Larry Gross, Vice-President  
Olivia E. García  
Roger Wolfson  
Alana Yañez

Meeting called to order at 10:10 a.m. Commissioners present were Zaft, Gross, García and Wolfson. Also present Los Angeles Animal Services (LAAS) Board Secretary Regina Gallegos, General Manager (GM) Brenda Barnette, Assistant General Manager, (AGM) Dana Brown; and Assistant City Attorney (ACA) Dov Lesel.

**Commissioner Zaft** opened the meeting and provided an overview of the meeting agenda. **Commissioner Gross** discussed the appeal hearing process prior to conducting the hearings.

I. ADMINISTRATIVE APPEALS

1. Dangerous Animal Case: DA 161161 WV

Respondent: Caleb Gipson, Michael Sparks, Laura Lewis and Abigail Hatch  
West Valley Animal Care and Control: Lieutenant Lorna Esparza

Complaining Witness: Gaylee Melissa Buckner (*taken out of order after I.2.*)

The Respondents were not present. The complaining witness Gaylee Buckner stated that the Respondents dog "Moomoo" almost killed her dog and bit her hand; has photos and medical bills. Ms. Buckner is not suing; is concerned for the safety of her family. The neighbor dogs need to be removed from the property. **Commissioner Zaft** stated that the property is a rehab facility with multiple people living on the property. The owner of the property isn't present at all times. **Commissioner Gross** stated that there are 3 dogs "Moomoo", Chubs" and "Luna" on the property. The dog "Moomoo" is responsible for the attacked; revoking the license of Caleb Gibson only. **ACA Lesel** at stated that the hearing decision applies to the four respondents. There is evidence to show that the dog "Moomoo" was involved and Caleb Gibson is the owner of the dog. The other three Respondents would be for the Commission to determine since not clear on the record. **Commissioner Zaft** stated that the owner of the Laura Lewis. It isn't sure who owns which dog on the property; this creates a safety issue. **AGM Dana Brown** mentioned the dog is unlicensed; the hearing officer made a judgment based on all the people who had control of the dog at the time of the incident; there is no license owner. **Commissioner Gross** Laura Lewis testified that she allows dogs on the property. The property owner is not taking responsibility.

**Commissioner Zaft**; stated that Laura Lewis and Caleb Gibson appealed the decision. **Neighbor** stated that he understands it's a rehab property with maximum six people living on the property, however on a regular basis there are more people living on the property.

**Commissioner Zaft** motioned to affirm the GM decision. The motion was seconded by **Commissioner Wolfson** and it was approved by a vote 4-0.

## 2. Dangerous Animal Case: DA 161111 BH

Respondent: Jay Stein and Carol Freedman Stein

West Los Angeles Animal Care and Control: Captain Wendell Bowers

Complaining Witness: Benjamin Samuel Levin, Michael Levin and Ruth Orloff

The Respondents Jay Stein and Carol Freedman Stein along with their Attorney Cheryl Ruggerio appeared before the Commission. None of the complaining Witnesses were present. **Attorney** Ruggerio stated that the Steins dog "Daphney" has always had valid spayed license. "Daphney" is an older dog and has been trained since a puppy by trainer Karen Kennedy. Unfortunately, at the time of the incident Mr. Stein didn't have hold of the leash and as a result "Daphney" ran out the front door. Mr Stein will not let this happen again. The problem is the Complaining Witness dog "Coco" who is the bitter and aggressor. **Commissioner Gross** stated that in the record there have been several occasions when Mr. Stein had dropped the leash and "Daphney" has been sighted running loose in the neighborhood. **Commissioner Wolfson** stated that the only influence the Commission has is just to speak specifically about the about hearing and if the hearing officer made a mistake. **Attorney** stated that the hearing examiner did not make a proper inquiry as to what could be done. Mr. Stein was unable to attend the hearing. **Commissioner Wolfson** asked if Mrs. Stein attended the hearing. **Attorney** stated that Mrs. Stein was at the hearing and testified that she would do whatever it takes to have "Daphney trained. **Commisisoner Wolfson** asked if the Steins argument is that the hearing officer failed to something they should have and therefore the decision by the hearing of the hearing officer is based on incomplete procedure. **Commissioner Gross** clarified with Ms. Kennedy if she was the trainer for the complaints and an email from Karen Kennedy that states "Daphney" run off the leash and scratched at the glass plates witnesses there's an email that states. Ms. Kennedy stated she did not see the email. She was hired from the complainants because of "Coco's" aggressive behavior had never seen "Daphney" off the leash or jump at the glass plates. **Commissioner Gross** the email states that Ms. Kennedy had witnessed "Daphney's" bad behavior. Attorney stated for the record hat the email is irrelevant. Ms. Kennedy stated that the Complainants did not complete the training. The behavior of Mr. Stein had nothing to do with the dogs "Daphney or "Coco" the incident occurred months ago. **Commissioner Wolfson** asked Ms. Kennedy if the email was based on what she witnessed or what she was told. Ms. Kennedy stated this is what she was told. **Commissioner Zaft** mentioned that the officer's report

states the Department's allegation is that Respondents dog attacked and injured a human being. The report stated that the evidence indicated the Respondents are unable to properly control, handle and/or maintain their dog in such a manner to prevent future attacks in reoccurring. Did not find any evidence that would support the hearing officer's conclusion or to the hearing officer made an inquiry as to whether or not the Steins would be able to properly control handle and or maintain their dog. **Commissioner Gross** stated there should be some terms and conditions issued based on the two incidents. **Commissioner Wolfson** made a motion to overturn the Department decision and established terms and condition that the dog be properly trained. **Commissioner Zaft** stated that the testimony indicated that the dog had training. The Steins need to maintain control with a leash; impose minimal terms and conditions. **Commissioner Wolfson** in the interest of the Department and safety of the community should insurance be included due to previous incidents or is this not the burden of the defendants. **Commissioner Zaft** mentioned that this is not the type of situation; there is reissuance of the license; no need for liability insurance. If an injury were to occur the Steins would be able to satisfy a judgment. **Commissioner Garcia** stated this is a lesson to the Steins; much time spent on this case; positive in the future the Respondents can control the leash which was much of the dispute.

**Commissioner Zaft** made an amendment to Commissioner Wolfsman's motion to overturn the General Manager's decision to reissue the Steins dog license; asked the Department to send out a reasonable and not overly burdensome terms and conditions.

**Commissioner Gross** seconded the motion and it was approved 4-0

## II. REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING

### 1. PUBLIC COMMENT

**Phyllis Daugherty:** Stated that Officer John Chavez has been appointed Budget Direct for the Mayor's Office. Mr. Chavez has an opened door policy; will discuss budget items; ensures tax payers money will be spent properly. Today at 3:00 p.m. will be at the home of hoarder; five cats have been taken from the property; removed a dead dog; no windows open for the last 20 years. The hoarder is an intelligent woman. This is one example of a hoarding; animals should never be given away for free.

### 2. NEIGHBORHOOD COUNCIL COMMENTS - (Discussion with Neighborhood Council representatives on Neighborhood Council Resolutions or Community Impact Statements filed with the City Clerk which relate to any agenda item listed or being considered on this agenda for the Board of Animal Services Commissioners.)

### 3. COMMISSION BUSINESS

- A. Approval of the Minutes for Special Meeting and Regular Meeting of September 27, 2016. (Action item; public comment limited to one minute per speaker).

**Commissioner Gross:** motioned to approve the minutes with changes Commissioner Wolfson identified. **Commissioner Garcia** seconded the motion and it was approved 4-0.

Public Comment  
None

### 4. ORAL REPORT OF THE GENERAL MANAGER

**GM Barnette** discussed the following:

- On September 16<sup>th</sup> Derek Brown Assistant General Manager (AGM) resigned his position. GM Barnette thanked Mr. Brown for his service.
- On September 21<sup>st</sup>, The Committee of the Future discussed information gather from the Stakeholders regarding the future direction of the dept. A presentation before for the Commission. Francisca Boxa will present materials. Steps , timeline and plan to achieve the goals
- Mentioned that Los Angeles County Board of Supervisors passed legislation related to the declaration of vicious dog and community cats. LAAS is not in support; future recommendations will be presented to the Commission.
- Mentioned that the hiring process of ACOs has been slow. There are five ACOs assigned to field work. Interviews will be held on Sept 30<sup>th</sup> for Volunteer Coordinator.
- On September 17<sup>th</sup>, The North Central Animal Shelter attended a Pet Adoption Celebration hosted by Assemblymember Jimmy Gomez. The event was a great success; 8 dogs and 6 cats were adopted. The Assembly presented North Central Shelter with a Certificate of Recognition.
- On Monday and Tuesday attended the annual CEO meeting of State Humane Association of California (SHAC). The focus was on leadership, leadership development and succession planning.
- On Wednesday, attended a meeting at the California Science Center it focused on the human animal bond. The exhibit is on the history of dogs; it is captivating and educational. The project is sponsored by the Annenberg Foundation. It is expected to be completed by 2017 followed by a national tour.
- Shared an email from City Attorney Michelle McGinnus on the outcome of a criminal investigation and conviction. In March of 2016, the Department investigated a case of animal cruelty involving an adult Doberman named

"Coco" the owner cut the dog's tail off with an unknown object. A criminal complaint was filed against the owner and there was a conviction on September 21, 2016. Commends the ACOs who work closely with the City Attorney Office on writing up these types of cases.

**Commissioner Zaft** commended the officers and vets who work on the cruelty cases; they do a terrific job.

**5. COMMISSIONERS' ORAL REPORTS AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**  
(Public comment limited to one minute per speaker).

**Commissioner Wolfson:** Expressed his appreciation that the two agenda items that mean most to him were prioritized.

**Commissioner Garcia:** Inquired about the spay/neuter vouchers to be issued in the field.

**AGM Dana Brown** responded that the vouchers will be issued tomorrow at the Inter City Law Office and at the Blessing of the Animals event; equipment took longer than anticipated.

**Commissioner Zaft:** participated in a strategic planning group meeting with Francisca Boxa, AGM Dana Brown and Mayor's Office; great response to the surveys from the community; 15 meetings throughout the City for the public. Francisca met with staff, volunteers, administration and officers. Francisca will include information in a report and present in December. The strategic plan will come before the Commission expectantly before next fiscal year in July; commended everybody who participated. Attend an event presented by the Animal Law Guild at Loyola Law School. The conference was on animal issues; focused on breed specific legislations and various laws around the country that mandate the destruction of animals involved in dog fighting rings and how there has been a push to change that. In January at the state level in California, The State Legislature and Governor Brown struck that requirement therefore; it will allow dogs to be evaluated. Dr. Steven Feldman gave a great presentation on a very difficult topic on the history of euthanasia. He keeps an archive dating back to the 1800s. He also highlighted the progress of the City Department; suggested to have Dr. Feldman give an abbreviated presentation to the Commission

**Commissioner Gross:** provided flyers on upcoming activities of the Department. There will be a Workshop on Pets and Housing October 12<sup>th</sup> in the shelters and in the evening. Sherman Oaks Street Fair on October 16<sup>th</sup>. There are many number of volunteers from the East Valley; encouraging volunteers to participate and save lives. Mentioned next Commissioners meeting is on the day of Kapparot. Concern of this issue; make sure our enforcement is ready to respond to complaints; have worked closely for the last two years with community activist. **GM Barnette** mentioned the



Department is on alert. **Commissioner Zaft** mentioned there are temples that have affirmed chickenless Kapparot; suggested the Department write a letter of appreciation.

No public Comment

## 6. BOARD REPORTS

- A. Staff Report Requesting Approval for Issuance of Request for Proposal to Operate Pet Supply Kiosks at City Shelters (Action item; public comment limited to two minutes per speaker)

**Sr. Management Analyst II (MAIL)** John Forland introduced Management Analyst Ryan Ellefson. Mr. Forland gave an overview of the RFP to Operate Pet Supply Kiosks; he worked with **ACA Lesel** to set a deadline on the RFP. There were some changes to define the issue of rent; reflect on the scoring; need to get word out to many organizations that may be interested. **GM Barnette** mentioned there were a few suggestions from Assistant City Attorney after the documents were posted. **Commissioner Zaft** asked to place updated copies out at the public desk. **Commissioner Gross** hopefully we get many applicants **Commissioner Garcia** agrees that the goal of the Kiosks is to have at underserved areas; the benefit is partnering with the City. **Commissioner Wolfson** mentioned Kiosks will make shelters more inviting. This has been well received. The idea was conceived over a year ago; commended General Manager Barnette for the contacts and support; thanked John Forland and Assistant Attorney for their time; very impressed and grateful. **Commissioner Zaft** asked if the scoring can reflect favoring applicants who are proposing to operate more than one shelter. John Forland asked do we identify a particular shelter. **Commissioner Zaft** other than West Los Angeles Shelter, we certainly want South Los Angeles Shelter to be served by the RFP as well as other shelters. **Commissioner Wolfson** should we consider the idea to require all six districts be served; if not a good response consider to modify. **Commissioner Zaft** this may discourage applicants. John Forland stated the City negotiates it has the final say. **Commissioner Wolfson** stated no other City has done this yet; this is a flagship opportunity for a major company; approach small pets stores give a chance to compete and also non- profit. Best Friends is very excited to help promote. **Commissioner Zaft** requested to add an additional 30 days to the RFP deadline.

No public comment

**Commissioner Wolfson** motioned to send out the RFP. **Commissioner Zaft** seconded the motion and it was approved 4-0.

- B. Staff Report Regarding Proposal from WAG! to provide “Wag Bags” to Department to distribute to adopters. (Action item; public comment limited to two minutes per speaker) (*taken out of order after item 6.D.*)

**GM Barnette** stated more testimonials needed from wag; not to set Department as a marketing agency for non profits or for profit business; not able to calculate a benefit to the City or Animal Services. **Commissioner Wolfson** to reach the goal “No Kill” City, animals need to be cared for. We need to involve the private sector. Wag is offering a goody bag and five free walks. Wag is licensed and bonded and professionally selected. This is a very generous offer. Thanked Commissioner Zaft and General Manager Barnette. **WAG** gave a presentation on their services. Wag works with local shelters and in other states. Best Friends is receiving ten cents for walks. Wag is offering goody bags; will impact the City by getting more dogs adopted. Wag focuses on making a better life for animals and their owners. **GM Barnette** mentioned WAG didn’t make an offer to the City. **Commissioner Zaft** stated that WAG sounds great and innovated. In regards to the proposal doesn’t see it as a donation to the shelters. The City is not a private rescue or independent Humane Society. There some possible issues – If we do for profit and non- profit Company will need to do for all companies and the City implicitly endorsing a private company. WAG can go through the shelters volunteer program and donate their dog walkers. **Commissioner Gross** appreciates the offer from Wag. There are similar concerns with the policy and issue of liability with the City. Encourage WAG to offer donation outside the shelters. **Commissioner Garcia** how hard would it be to establish guidelines for the future donations. **ACA Lesel** stated The City has a series of policies that are reflected through the Administrative Codes, Municipal Codes and City Charter on non-endorsing of products. Some are through CAO and Risk Management on issues of liability. Also endorsing and promoting a private business all of which both the City Charter and Municipal Codes frown on; not something the City is not allowed to do. **Commissioner Wolfson** respects the City Attorney Office and understands it has to protect the City. Asked WAG how often have there been problems with dogs in their business. **WAG** not many problems; number one is customer service and resources. **Commissioner Wolfson** asked if WAG would be willing to include a disclaimer. **WAG** responded “Yes”. **Commissioner Wolfson** speaking as an Attorney that would satisfy my concerns. What is wrong with opening the floodgates. **Commissioner Zaft** responded once you set a precedent you have to abide; City cannot pick and choose; there involved rules on RFP and Bids. Once you say yes to one you have to say yes to all. The City is part of the government. **Commissioner Wolfson** first time anyone has made an offer like this. We are not rubberstamping; this took months to get on the agenda. The City has established a process in which we can evaluate on its own merit. **Commissioner Zaft** don’t see a tangible benefit for the department; no connection. **Commissioner Gross** as you heard from the Assistant City Attorney there are very strict policies and restrictions for this type of activity. City is very concerned about issues; we are not a private rescue; we have to abide by the City. **WAG** in terms of the idea of

donating walks we will be happy to look into it. We encourage walkers to work at shelters; customers are everywhere; not only the wealthy utilize WAG services our customers are from every walk of life; Wag is the solution. **Commissioner Wolfson** has spoken to Assistant City Attorney about this in an email and an inclusion of waiver release form was satisfactory. **ACA Lesel** asked to see the email. This is not my position and never has been; echo what Commissioners have said regarding the services that Wag provides. WAG is motivated and well meaning. The issue is that the City would in fact be partnering; defending the City; potential liability. **Commissioner Wolfson** doesn't agree; appreciates the Assistant City Attorney opinion. **Commissioner Zaft** the Commission does look to rely upon on the Assistant City Attorney for legal advice. **Commissioner Wolfson** respects that everyone has different opinions; wants people to be encourage coming to LAAS with donations and partnership opportunities; we need them; the animals need them our customers need them. This is very upsetting.

No public comment

**Commissioner Zaft** the Board Action recommended by the staff is to support the Department's recommendation to decline the proposal.

**Commissioner Gross** motioned to support staff recommendation to decline the offer. **Commissioner Zaft** seconded the motion.

A vote was taken 2 "Yes" and 2 "Opposed".

**Commissioner Zaft** if this item is to be brought back as a future agenda item; request that Commissioner Wolfson provide a report to the Commission to explain how the item doesn't violate the City Charter and the City Rules.

- C. Staff Report and Request for approval to increase the reimbursement rate to our vet partners for spay/neuter of shelter animals. (Action item; public comment limited to two minutes per speaker.

**AGM Dana Brown** recommended that Board approve the reimbursement fees to our vet partners for all surgeries spay/neuter for public and shelter animals. The proposal is to make the reimburse amounts the same for shelter animals; animals being prepared for adoption; animals in preparation for pick up. Increase the amount reimbursed to vet partners for dogs and rabbits to \$125 per surgery and increase the amount to vets partners for cats to \$75. **Commissioner Zaft** this is a logical proposal and fair to vets.

Public Comment:

**Jessica Lopez:** stated that SNP agrees with the proposal to increase rates; rates average \$120-130 per surgery.

**Phyllis Daugherty**: glad to hear vets will be paid; Dr. Macky will be 80 years old; birthday party will be held at the harbor; Veterans Money Newsletter has many good articles; asked about the issue that vets don't get paid soon enough. **Sr. Administrative Clerk Brenda Van Den Bosch** stated payments to vets were done manually in the past; payments took a month or longer to process; payments are now processed electronically all vendors are being paid on time. **Commissioner Gross** asked for an update on East Valley RFP. **GM Barnette** stated RFP is completed; waiting for responses.

**Commissioner Gross** motioned to approve staff recommendation to increase reimbursement rate to our Vets. **Commissioner Garcia** seconded the motion and it was approved 4-0.

D. Woofstat Report for June, July and August 2016. June Woofstat report is continued from August 9, 2016. (Public comment limited to one minute per speaker.)

**GM Barnette** stated in June 2016; impounds are down 10 %; live save/ rate at the end of the year overall 78.74% which is up; goal was 75% attributed to great work with dogs. Cats have also increased 17% credited to the underwriting of the adoptions fees from the ASPC. License issues were down in June; overall were up to 131, 958 license compared to 120, 917 up 9%; this is the largest increase due to ACE citations implemented in shelters. **Commissioner Zaft** asked if old and new license can be divided overall. **GM Barnette** will run specific reports on licenses. Euthanize of dogs and cats for this year were 8,748 compared to 11,737 last year this is down by 25%. Surgeries by vets have done very well. Received ACE citation report from the City Attorney's Office asking for details on the collections to share with public. The volunteer program is going good although some volunteers don't sign in. **Commissioner Zaft** stated that the numbers show progress. The West Los Angeles Shelter showed 100 dogs euthanized; adoptions were up in every shelter with the exception of West Los Angeles Shelter. The numbers for Best Friends and New Hope have gone up and down. **GM Barnette** thanked the Commissioners for passing items such as keeping adoptable animals over the weekend and rescuers not to be involved in bidding when there is are prime animals. Staff and volunteers want to be part of the solution and do fun adoptions. Vets are feeling good in participating in getting animals in homes. **Commissioner Zaft** every shelter with the exception of South Los Angeles Shelter has a life saving rate above 90% trend moving in the direction. **GM Barnette** the shelters are working well together; not much foot traffic in South Los Angeles to adopt; South Los Angeles is a terrific shelter; animals are transferred out to other shelters. **Commissioner Gross** this is going in the right direction. This is an indication committed staff and volunteers; keep focus on South Los Angeles Shelter on euthanasia. **Commissioner Garcia** addressing the foot traffic at South Los Angeles Shelter can this be due to less visibility of the street. **GM Barnette** mentioned failed to embrace the community. Best Friends made a Poster to direct traffic to the

shelters. **Commissioner Zaft** interested to hear what ideas in embracing the Community; need adequate signage; engaging in various ways with the community will help elevate the status of the shelter. **GM Barnette** mentioned when attending district meetings request for humane education across the board. There's an amazing group of volunteers working on launching humane education. **Commissioner Gross** regarding the effort for South Los Angeles will Council be involved. **GM Barnette** mentioned Council involved in every aspect. Neighbor Hood Council, retired teachers and educators have expressed interest. **Commissioner Wolfson** the numbers are encouraging. Thanked General Manager Barnette for her vision and authority with Animal Services; commended the Commissioners who have served for two years and longer for their leadership and consistency. Thanked everybody involved. Last hearing Best Friends Executive Director Marc Peralta stated a "No Kill" is this possible. How can we help as a Commission to make this happen? **GM Barnette** by next fiscal year 2017 this will happen. The important part is what happens in 2018 to maintain "No Kill" this is what staff is working on. **Commissioner Wolfson** our goal is to be responsive to you as you are to us. **Commissioner Zaft** August 2016 report showed large impoundment of animals. **GM Barnette** there were three major busts; its kitten season.

Public Comment:

**Phyllis Daugherty:** no kill is not City wide; going out to pick up five cats today that were giving to your rescue; this means that six areas in the City not picking up animals; animals are given to anybody; lady had 67 animals; took 29 from the shelters; another bust of 120 animals; no one cares about the animals as long as their out of the shelter; animals are dying ;officers don't have vehicles to pick them up this is not "No Kill" it's putting it somewhere else.

E. Animal Welfare Trust and Animal Sterilization Fund Balances for July 2016.  
(Public comment limited to one minute)

No Public Comment

**Commissioner Gross** asked about the voucher billing. **Sr. AC Licican** stated there are some problems with the vouchers; not able to process in the month of July. There are 2 contracts for renewal. There is no general fund subsidy for revenue. **GM Barnette** stated there is money in the account. Planning to increase the spay/neuter fees; use this fund before the next budget. For FY 2015-2016- received \$500,000.

**Commissioner Gross** motioned to adjourn the meeting. **Commissioner Garcia** seconded the motion and it was approved 4-0.

Meeting ended at 12:48 p.m.