

BOARD OF ANIMAL SERVICES COMMISSIONERS CITY OF LOS ANGELES

REGULAR MEETING AGENDA Tuesday, March 12, 2019 9:00 A.M.

LOS ANGELES CITY HALL, ROOM 1060 200 NORTH SPRING STREET LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90012

> LARRY GROSS President

OLIVIA E. GARCÍA Vice-President

ALISA FINSTEN JOSE SANDOVAL ROGER WOLFSON

Sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or other auxiliary aids and/or services may be provided upon request. To ensure availability, you are advised to make your request at least 72 hours prior to the meeting you wish to attend. For information please call (213) 482-9558.

Si requiere servicios de traducción, favor de hacer pedido con 24 horas de anticipo al (213) 482-9558.

I. ADMINISTRATIVE APPEALS

- Dangerous Animal Case: DI 184585 NC Appellant(s): Albert Ta North Central Animal Services Center: Lieutenant Angela Hooks Complaining Witness: Sylvia Gonzalez
- 2. **Dangerous Animal Case: DA 184587 WV** Appellant(s): Maria F. De La Rosa West Valley Animal Services Center: Captain Lorna Esparza Complaining Witness: Daniel Joyce

Board of Animal Services Commissioners Meeting Meeting Agenda March 12, 2019 Page 2

- 3. Dangerous Animal Case: DA 183479 EV Appellant(s): Rachelle Wells East Valley Animal Services Center: Lieutenant Jose Gonzalez Complaining Witness: Jennifer Hourigan
- 4. **Dangerous Animal Case: DA 181267 SLA** Appellant(s): Jonathon Robinson South Los Angeles Animal Services Center: Lieutenant John Cessna Complaining Witness: LAPD Officer Roach and LAPD Officer Evis

II. REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING

1. **PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD** - (Comments from the public on items of public interest within the Board's subject matter jurisdiction that are not on the Agenda)

Public Comments: The Brown Act prohibits the Board and staff from responding to the speakers' comments. Some of the matters raised in public comment may appear on a future agenda.

2. NEIGHBORHOOD COUNCIL COMMENTS - (Discussion with Neighborhood Council representatives on Neighborhood Council Resolutions or Community Impact Statements filed with the City Clerk which relate to any agenda item listed or being considered on this agenda for the Board of Animal Services Commissioners)

3. COMMISSION BUSINESS

A. Approval of Minutes for the Meeting of February 26, 2019. (Action Item)

4. ORAL REPORT OF THE GENERAL MANAGER

5. COMMISSIONERS' ORAL REPORTS AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

6. BOARD REPORTS

- A. Authorize the Use of Animal Welfare Trust Funds to Host a Volunteer Appreciation Event. (Action Item)
- B. Recommendation to Support Senate Bill No. 313 (Hueso) Prohibition on the Use of Wild and Exotic Animals in Traveling Animal Acts. (Action Item)
- C. Recommendation to Amend the Los Angeles Municipal Code to Prohibit Rodeo Events in the City of Los Angeles. (Action Item)

7. ADJOURNMENT

Next Regular Meeting is scheduled for 9:00 A.M., March 26, 2019, at City Hall 200 North Spring Street, Room 1060, Los Angeles, CA 90012. (Enter on Main Street).

<u>AGENDAS</u> - The Board of Animal Services Commissioners (Board) meets regularly every second (2nd) and fourth (4th) Tuesday of each month at 9:00 A.M. Regular Meetings are held at City Hall, 200 North Spring Street, Room 1060, in Los Angeles, CA 90012. Evening Meetings are held in various locations throughout the City, from 7:00 to approximately 9:30 P.M. The agendas for Board meetings contain a brief general description of those items to be considered at the meetings. Board Agendas are available at the Department of Animal Services (Department), Administrative Division, 221 North Figueroa Street, 6th Floor, Suite 600, Los Angeles, CA 90012. Board Agendas may also be viewed on the 2nd floor Public Bulletin Board in City Hall East, 200 North Main Street, Los Angeles, CA 90012. Internet users may also access copies of present and prior agenda items, copies of the Board Calendar, MP-3 audio files of meetings as well as electronic copies of approved minutes on the Department's World Wide Web Home Page site at http://www.laanimalservices.com/CommissionAgendas.htm

Three (3) members of the Board constitute a quorum for the transaction of business. Some items on the Agenda may be approved without any discussion.

The Board Secretary will announce the items to be considered by the Board. The Board will hear the presentation on the topic and gather additional information from Department Staff. Once presentations have finished, the Board President will ask if any Board Member or member of the public wishes to speak on one or more of these items. Each speaker called before the Commission will have one (1) minute to express their comments and concerns on matters placed on the agenda. (For certain agenda items, speakers will have two (2) minutes.)

<u>PUBLIC INPUT AT BOARD MEETINGS</u> – Public Participation on Agenda Items. Members of the public will have an opportunity to address the Board on agenda items after the item is called and before the Board takes action on the item, unless the opportunity for public participation on the item was previously provided to all interested members of the public at a public meeting of a Committee of the Board and the item has not substantially changed since the Committee heard the item. When speaking to an agenda item other than during Public Comment (see Public Comment below), the speaker shall limit his or her comments to the specific item under consideration (California Government Code, Section 54954.3).

Public Comment. The Board will provide an opportunity for public comment at every regular meeting of the Board. Members of the public may address the Board on any items within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Board as part of Public Comment.

Speaker Cards. Members of the public wishing to speak are to fill out one speaker card for each agenda item on which they wish to speak and present it to the Board secretary **<u>before</u>** the item is called.

Time Limit for Speakers. Speakers addressing the Board will be limited to one (1) minute of speaking time for each agenda item except during general public comment period which is limited to two (2) minutes per speaker. (For certain agenda items, speakers will have two (2) minutes each.). The Chairperson, with the approval of a majority of the Board, may for good cause extend any speaker's time by increments of up to one (1) minute.

Brown Act. These rules shall be interpreted in a manner that is consistent with the Ralph M. Brown Act, California Government Code Section § 54950 et seq.

Please join us at our website: www.LAAnimalservices.com

Board of Animal Services Commissioners Meeting Meeting Agenda March 12, 2019 Page 4

STANDARDS OF CONDUCT. Speakers are expected to behave in an orderly manner and to refrain from personal attacks or use of profanity or language that may incite violence.

All persons present at Board meetings are expected to behave in an orderly manner and to refrain from disrupting the meeting, interfering with the rights of others to address the Board and/or interfering with the conduct of business by the Board.

In the event that any speaker does not comply with the foregoing requirements, or if a speaker does not address the specific item under consideration, the speaker may be ruled out of order, their speaking time forfeited and the Chairperson may call upon the next speaker.

The Board, by majority vote, may order the removal from the meeting of any speaker or audience member continuing to behave in a disruptive manner after being warned by the Chairperson regarding their behavior. Section 403 of the California Penal Code states as follows: "Every person who, without authority of law, willfully disturbs or breaks up any assembly or meeting that is not unlawful in its character, other than an assembly or meeting referred to in Section 302 of the Penal Code or Section 18340 of the Elections Code, is guilty of a misdemeanor."

<u>VOTING AND DISPOSITION OF ITEMS</u> – Most items require a majority vote of the entire membership of the Board (3 members). When debate on an item is completed, the Board President will instruct the Secretary to "call the roll". Every member present must vote for or against each item; abstentions are not permitted unless there is a Conflict of Interest for which the Board member is obliged to abstain from voting. The Secretary will announce the votes on each item. Any member of the Board may move to "reconsider" any vote on any item on the agenda, except to adjourn, suspend the Rules, or where an intervening event has deprived the Board of jurisdiction, providing that said member originally voted on the prevailing side of the item. The motion to "reconsider" shall only be in order once during the meeting, and once during the next regular meeting. The member requesting reconsideration shall identify for all members present the Agenda number and subject matter previously voted upon. A motion to reconsider is not debatable and shall require an affirmative vote of three members of the Board.

When the Board has failed by sufficient votes to approve or reject an item, and has not lost jurisdiction over the matter, or has not caused it to be continued beyond the next regular meeting, the issue is again placed on the next agenda for the following meeting for the purpose of allowing the Board to again vote on the matter.

BOARD OF ANIMAL SERVICES COMMISSIONERS

LARRY GROSS

OLIVIA E. GARCIA

COMMISSIONERS

ALISA FINSTEN

JOSE SANDOVAL

ROGER WOLFSON

City of Los Angeles

CALIFORNIA



ERIC GARCETTI MAYOR DEPARTMENT OF ANIMAL SERVICES 221 N. Figueroa Street 6TH Floor, Suite #600 Los Angeles, CA 90012

(888) 452-7381 FAX (213) 482-9511

BRENDA F. BARNETTE GENERAL MANAGER

TAMMY WATSON ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER Administration

MELISSA WEBBER ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER Lifesaving

DR. JEREMY PRUPAS CHIEF VETERINARIAN

NOTIFICATION OF ADMINISTRATIVE APPEAL HEARINGS

To Be Held: Tuesday, March 12, 2019, at 9:00 A.M. City Hall 200 North Spring Street, 10th Floor, Room 1060 Los Angeles, CA 90012 (Entrance on Main Street)

This serves as formal notice pursuant to Section § 53.18(q) 4 of the Los Angeles Municipal Code (LAMC) to the following parties and witnesses in the appeal(s) listed below:

 Dangerous Animal Case: DI 184585 NC Appellant(s): Albert Ta North Central Animal Services Center: Lieutenant Angela Hooks Complaining Witness: Sylvia Gonzalez

Dangerous Animal Case: DA 184587 WV Appellant(s): Maria F. De La Rosa West Valley Animal Services Center: Captain Lorna Esparza Complaining Witness: Daniel Joyce

- Dangerous Animal Case: DA 183479 EV Appellant(s): Rachelle Wells East Valley Animal Services Center: Lieutenant Jose Gonzalez Complaining Witness: Jennifer Hourigan
- Dangerous Animal Case: DA 181267 SLA Appellant(s): Jonathon Robinson South Los Angeles Animal Services Center: Lieutenant John Cessna Complaining Witness: LAPD Officer Roach and LAPD Officer Evis

These hearings will not be rescheduled, except for good cause.

As a covered entity under Title II of the Americans with Disabilities Act, the City of Los Angeles does not discriminate on the basis of disability and, upon request, will provide reasonable accommodation to ensure equal access to its programs, services and activities. Sign Language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or other auxiliary aids and/or services may be provided upon request. To ensure

"Creating a Humane LA"

AN EQUAL OPPORTUNITY EMPLOYER

availability, you are advised to make your request at least 72 hours prior to the meeting you wish to attend.

For additional information, please refer to the Board's "Rules and Procedures for Appeals", or contact the Department of Animal Services at (213) 482-9558, or visit the Department's website: <u>http://www.laanimalservices.com/</u>. Written statements are to be submitted to the Commission seven days prior and, if in excess of 50 pages, seven hard copies must be provided. You may submit your statement (50 pages or less) via email to: <u>ani.commission@lacity.org</u>.



BOARD OF ANIMAL SERVICES COMMISSIONERS CITY OF LOS ANGELES

MINUTES TUESDAY, February 26, 2019 at 7:00 PM



WEST VALLEY ANIMAL SERVICES CENTER 20655 PLUMMER STREET CHATSWORTH, CALIFORNIA 91311

Audio MP-3 Recording is available at www.laanimalservices.com

Larry Gross, President Olivia E. García, Vice President Alisa Finsten Jose Sandoval Roger Wolfson

Meeting called to order at 7:24 p.m. Commissioners present were Finsten, García (7:37 p.m.), Gross and Wolfson (7:38 p.m.). Also present from Los Angeles Animal Services (LAAS) was General Manager (GM) Brenda Barnette, Assistant General Manager (AGM) Tammy Watson, AGM MeLissa Webber, Commission Executive Assistant, LaTonya Dean and Assistant City Attorney (ACA) Dov Lesel.

Commissioner Gross opened the meeting, introduced staff and provided an overview of the meeting agenda. He also noted that it was the 25th Annual World Spay Day and it provides an opportunity for shelters and rescue organizations to highlight their spay/neuter programs and win more support from the community in the form of donations, volunteers and clients.

REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING

1. PUBLIC COMMENT

Gabriele Hartel was here four years ago to talk about the animal control vehicles when it was really bad. Wanted to thank the Board for providing the Department with new vehicles and described some of the benefits of the new vehicles. She also thanked the Department for offering an employee appreciation event with free adoptions.

Andrew S. Brown spoke about a part of the adoption policy that he found troubling and described a recent situation which had occurred with a dog that was considered a stray named Becca. He stated that the adoption contract language needed to be changed.

Brandii Grace, Brandii Grace for City Council, suggested that the Department lower the age of volunteers. Additionally, she asked if something could be done to address the heat in the cat room.

Phyllis Daugherty, Animal Issues Movement, wanted the Board to be aware that the phones were out at the East Valley shelter for four days this month. She also stated that the criticism about the animal trucks was well deserved because it took 15 years of complaining before they were replaced and she expressed concern of the use of the Animal Welfare Trust Funds for two items on the agenda.

2. NEIGHBORHOOD COUNCIL COMMENTS - (Discussion with Neighborhood Council representatives on Neighborhood Council Resolutions or Community Impact

Board of Animal Services Commissioners Minutes for the February 26, 2019 Commission Meeting Page 2

Statements filed with the City Clerk which relate to any agenda item listed or being considered on this agenda for the Board of Animal Services Commissioners)

Public Comment: None.

3. COMMISSION BUSINESS

A. Approval of the Minutes for Meeting of January 22, 2019.

Public Comment: None.

Commissioner García moved to approve the minutes of January 22, 2019. **Commissioner Wolfson** seconded and the motion was approved by a unanimous vote of 4-0.

Ayes: Finsten, García, Gross and Wolfson

Noes: None.

Absent: Sandoval

4. ORAL REPORT OF THE GENERAL MANAGER

GM Barnette discussed the following:

- A new bill was introduced in the California State Senate that would make it illegal to use or allow the use of wild and exotic animals in traveling acts. GM Barnette felt this was a good next step after the banning of the bull hooks, however there were some people in the community that had a different perception of the bill and the Department would look at the pros and cons and bring the bill back for the Board's consideration.
- There is a statewide initiative to ban the declawing of cats.
- The West Valley Shelter had a successful Valentine's Day Dog hike which was an idea brought to the Department by a volunteer.
- We have had a number of special weekends with reduced fee adoptions throughout the month of February including the "My Furry Valentine' event which took place on February 16th and 17th and a rabbit mobile pet adoption event at Rose Bunny Bean on February 24th.
- On February 12th, officers at the Chesterfield Square Center received a complaint that animals were being housed in unsanitary conditions. Upon their arrival the officers on site found the animals to be in deplorable conditions and immediately impounded the animals for their health and safety. They impounded 29 dogs, 16 doves and one cat.

- On February 2nd East Valley received a call from the Animal Cruelty Task Force requesting assistance with calls they received about a cat that was "kidnapped" and was being held in a garage. As it turns out the couple most likely didn't hear them knocking. Their son was contacted who let them in and Esmerelda the cat came out and returned to her owner who vowed to keep the adventurous kitty indoors from now on.
- The SMART team members have had a number of rescues including a cat rescued from a tree, a hawk trapped in a lip balm factory, a mallard duck with plastic soda can wrappings around its neck and a goose with fishing hooks stuck in its legs. SMART team members had to deploy their motorized inflatable boat to rescue the goose. Once the hooks were removed, the goose was transported to a rescue where it is recuperating and will be released once it is well.
- General Services and some of our staff met with King Wire Partitions, Inc. to discuss the extensions of the awnings at the West Los Angeles Animal Services Center. We will come back with a report on the cost at another time.
- The first BunnyLuvPlaygroup Program was held at the East Valley Animal Services Center. This new bunny enrichment program introduced by Animal Care Technician Supervisor, Christine Carr and others is for the bunnies to get exercise and to be seen in another light other than in a cage for potential adopters.
- For World Spay Day, the Department launched downloadable spay and neuter vouchers which can be printed from the Department's website. The vouchers are coupons that the Department gives to people to allow them to spay and neuter their dogs and cats for free or at a reduced rate.

Commissioner Gross asked if there were any budget updates. **GM Barnette** responded there were no updates and that staff met with the Mayor's team and they reviewed the budget request with us. They will give us all feedback in the form of a blue book sometime in April.

Public Comment:

Phyllis Daugherty, Animals Issues Movement, received the notice today of the spay vouchers, but stated that nothing was on the website announcing it. Also, she stated that the shelter conditions are deplorable, especially at two of the animal centers.

5. COMMISSIONERS' ORAL REPORTS AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Commissioner Wolfson: Passed

Commissioner García: Requested an update on the Trap-Neuter-Release injunction.

Commissioner Finsten: Requested an update on the 311 Phone System and a description of the process for notifying the Department when phones go out at individual shelters.

Commissioner Gross: Requested staff to follow up on the report that the West

Please join us at our website: <u>www.LAAnimalservices.com</u>

Valley was too hot and the suggestion on the canopy.

Public Comment: None.

6. Board Reports

A. Approval to Release Marketing, Fundraising, Public Relations and Website Development/Management Services Request for Proposals (RFP).

GM Barnette stated that the report did not include dollar amounts because the Department is seeking proposals. Once the proposals were received a committee would compare them and make a recommendation if a candidate was found. Commissioner Finsten asked if a dollar amount was required to be listed in the RFP. GM Barnette responded that it was not required and noted that the Department had sought proposals for these services before, however the proposals received did not describe clearly how their services would help the Commissioner Finsten inquired if we were prohibited from Department. including a dollar amount in the RFP to which GM Barnette responded that the Department was not prohibited. Commissioner Finsten also asked if this would be a clear division of labor with current staff. **GM Barnette** responded that it would be a clear division. Commissioner Gross asked if the successful proposer would promote events. GM Barnette responded that the Department would need to see what their proposals said but we may continue to promote them in-house, however she sees them working together with the Department if that is appropriate. Commissioner García asked if the GM saw this as being something that would become a part of the whole package of marketing. GM Barnette responded that she was hopeful that if this was successful the City would consider giving the Department the resources to run it in-house. **Commissioner Gross** asked if the item was approved, when the target goal for release of the RFP would be. **GM Barnette** responded that it could be released immediately.

Public Comment:

Phyllis Daugherty stated she had seen dozens of these go through and that they never worked. She also stated that the purpose should be not to grow the Department, but to shrink it and that animal shelters should not be branded.

Commissioner Finsten made a motion to approve the RFP for marketing, fundraising, public relations and website development. **Commissioner Wolfson** seconded and the motion was approved by a unanimous vote of 4-0.

Ayes: Finsten, García, Gross and Wolfson

Noes: None.

- Absent: Sandoval
- B. Authorize the Use of Animal Welfare Trust Funds to Purchase Annual Subscriptions for Public Relations and Media Monitoring Services from Trendkite, Inc.

Please join us at our website: www.LAAnimalservices.com

GM Barnette reported that this was a renewal for a subscription that was authorized last year and that she believed that the cost is between \$7,000-\$8,000. **Commissioner García** asked if Trendkite provided data reports and **GM Barnette** responded that reports were provided through the service.

Public Comment:

Phyllis Daugherty stated that the Department was spending money on this subscription when it could be spent on awnings or to cool the cat room. She also noted that upon a review of their website, Trendkite does not have anything to do with animals.

Andrew Brown did not feel that the payment for the subscription should come from the Animal Welfare Trust Fund Account.

ACA Lesel stated that if this service provided the Department with information that assisted it with being able to put on events or adoptions, or provided information that would affect the welfare of the animals the Animal Welfare Trust Fund could be used for that purpose.

Commissioner Gross moved to approve the use of Animal Welfare Trust Funds to pay Trendkite for annual subscription cost, contingent upon the cost not exceeding the \$7,000-\$8,000 of the previous contract. **Commissioner García** seconded and the motion was approved by a unanimous vote of 4-0.

Ayes:	Finsten, García, Gross and Wolfson
Noes:	None.
Absent:	Sandoval

C. Authorize the Use of Animal Welfare Trust Funds for Loehr Animal Behavior Enrichment Training Program.

AGM Webber reported that this program would have representatives of Loehr Animal Behavior come in and spend the day at each shelter. The first half of the day would be observation and consultation and the second half of the day would be training staff and volunteers to better read and understand both dog and cat body language among other things. This training would be an enrichment program that would benefit the animals, volunteers and staff. Commissioner Gross asked how this program would interact with the other enrichment programs. AGM Webber responded that it would enhance the other types of programs that the Department has and she described the different types of enrichment programs and how they are complimentary to each other. **Commissioner Gross** asked if this was the first time that the Department was using this program. AGM Webber responded that it was, but that the organization had a nationwide shelter program that it conducts. Commissioner Finsten asked if there was an RFP process for this program. GM Barnette responded that it was not as this was almost like a sole-source because of the unique services it provides. AGM Webber stated that this would provide training to staff to also be able to safely handle animals that might not necessarily be safe

animals. She further discussed the credentials and experience of the founder of Loehr Animal Behavior program.

Public Comment:

Phyllis Daugherty spoke about some of the Loehr founder's writings about placing marginal dogs. She stated that she hoped that the founder had some of the same philosophies of her writings and that the program results in saving the lives of animals and preventing horrible staff injuries.

Andrew Brown stated that in his experience there had been an overwhelming number of dogs that received horrible behavior notes that were fine when he took them out. If this program could train our staff on how to handle the animals he believes it may lead to fewer negative behavior notes for dogs because staff will be reading the animals correctly.

Commissioner García moved to approve the use of Animal Welfare Trust Funds for the Loehr Animal Behavior Enrichment Training Program. **Commissioner Wolfson** seconded and the motion was approved by a unanimous vote of 4-0.

Ayes: Finsten, García, Gross and Wolfson

Noes: None.

Absent: Sandoval

D. Request to Expand the Location and Hours of the Volunteer Program for 12-15 Year Olds with Adult Sponsor.

GM Barnette this program started as a pilot program at the East Valley Animal Services Center. **AGM Watson** noted that the pilot program was successful and currently had seven, two-person teams and the Department was seeking to expand the program to the other five animal centers. **AGM Watson** further noted that during the Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD) teacher strike we had an overwhelming increase in student volunteers and that is why we are seeking to expand the program. **Commissioner Wolfson** stated that he was thrilled that the Department was doing this program.

Public Comment:

Phyllis Daugherty hoped that the Department only lets legal guardians or parents of the children work as sponsors in the shelters. **GM Barnette** noted that the adult must be selected by the parent if the sponsor is not the child's parent.

Brandii Grace spoke about her experience as a child volunteer in the shelter and stated she supported the item and hoped the Commission would consider expanding it as well.

Commissioner Wolfson moved to approve the request to expand the locations and hours of the volunteer program for 12-15 year olds with adult sponsors. **Commissioner Finsten** seconded and the motion was approved by a unanimous vote of 4-0.

Board of Animal Services Commissioners Minutes for the February 26, 2019 Commission Meeting Page 7

Absent:

Ayes:Finsten, García, Gross and WolfsonNoes:None.

E. Bequest from the Walter R. Wormell Intervivos Trust.

Sandoval

AGM Watson reported that the Department received a check in the amount of \$119,000 from the Walter R. Wormell Trust and was seeking the approval to deposit the funds in the Animal Welfare Trust Fund, subject to the approval of the Mayor and City Council.

Public Comment: None.

Commissioner Wolfson moved to receive the bequest. **Commissioner Finsten** seconded and the motion was approved by a unanimous vote of 4-0.

Ayes: Finsten, García, Gross and Wolfson

Noes: None.

Absent: Sandoval

F. Discussion on Dog Limits in the City of Los Angeles; Reference Council File No. 17-1237-S1.

Commissioner Gross explained that a motion by Council Member Koretz was put forth to amend a zoning code to increase the number of cats and dogs per household. This Commission was instructed to gather public input.

Public Comment: None.

7. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting ended at 8:28 p.m.

BOARD OF ANIMAL SERVICES COMMISSIONERS

LARRY GROSS

OLIVIA E. GARCIA

COMMISSIONERS

ALISA FINSTEN

JOSE SANDOVAL

ROGER WOLFSON

City of Los Angeles

CALIFORNIA



ERIC GARCETTI MAYOR DEPARTMENT OF ANIMAL SERVICES 221 N. Figueroa Street 6TH Floor, Suite #600 Los Angeles, CA 90012

(888) 452-7381 FAX (213) 482-9511

BRENDA F. BARNETTE GENERAL MANAGER

TAMMY WATSON ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER Administration

MELISSA WEBBER ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER Lifesaving

DR. JEREMY PRUPAS CHIEF VETERINARIAN

Report to the Board of Animal Services Commissioners

MEETING DATE: March 12, 2019

PREPARED BY: Carolyn Almos

REPORT DATE: February 26, 2019

TITLE: Director of Volunteer Programs

SUBJECT: AUTHORIZE THE USE OF ANIMAL WELFARE TRUST FUNDS TO HOST A VOLUNTEER APPRECIATION EVENT

BOARD ACTION RECOMMENDED:

APPROVE the use of up to \$30,000 in Animal Welfare Trust Funds (AWTF) to host a volunteer appreciation event.

BACKGROUND:

Volunteers are an integral part of the Los Angeles Animal Services (LAAS) operations. Volunteers supplement and compliment the work of the staff by helping to maintain the facilities and animals' living spaces, socializing, exercising, photographing and publicizing animals, and assisting members of the public with adoptions. This year has seen a large increase in the number of volunteers, up from approximately 1,500 in June 2018 to over 2,300 in February 2019. This year has also seen volunteers step into expanding leadership roles, including but not limited to, leading playgroups, mobile pet adoptions and coming up with innovative improvements to the ways we track care and behavioral progress of the animals who stay with us. In short, without volunteers, the staff alone would not be able to provide the animals with the amount of affection, attention and enrichment we all agree they deserve.

SUMMARY:

The LAAS Volunteer Appreciation Event will honor our volunteers for the endless hours of service and support they donate to the animals and to our City. The event will be a Sunday afternoon picnic at the Crystal Springs Picnic Area in Griffith Park on April 28th. Catering by Simply Fabulous Food will include vegan burgers grilled on site, a variety of side dishes and desserts and soft drinks. Picnic games and recorded music provided by DJ and ACT Eddie Sezate will entertain everyone. All attending volunteers will receive a gift bag as a token of gratitude, and there will be a special moment of recognition and commemorative token presented

"Creating a Humane LA"

AN EQUAL OPPORTUNITY EMPLOYER

Report to the Board of Animal Services Commissioners SUBJECT: AUTHORIZE THE USE OF ANIMAL WELFARE TRUST FUNDS TO HOST A VOLUNTEER APPRECIATION EVENT

to the 83 volunteers who have contributed 5, 10, 15 and even 20 years of service to the Department. The Crystal Springs Picnic Area can accommodate 800 people. The AWTF has approximately \$106,000 designated for Volunteer Services and use of these funds will allow us to recognize the invaluable, irreplaceable service of our volunteers.

FISCAL IMPACT:

There is no fiscal impact to the General Fund. The cost of the volunteer appreciation event will be expended from the Animal Welfare Trust Fund (Fund 859).

Approved:

Brenda Barnette, General Manager

BOARD ACTION:

Passed

Passed with noted modifications

Disapproved

Continued

Tabled

New Date

BOARD OF ANIMAL SERVICES COMMISSIONERS

LARRY GROSS

OLIVIA E. GARCIA

COMMISSIONERS

ALISA FINSTEN

JOSE SANDOVAL

ROGER WOLFSON

City of Los Angeles

CALIFORNIA



ERIC GARCETTI MAYOR DEPARTMENT OF ANIMAL SERVICES 221 N. Figueroa Street 6TH Floor, Suite #600 Los Angeles, CA 90012

(888) 452-7381 FAX (213) 482-9511

BRENDA F. BARNETTE GENERAL MANAGER

TAMMY WATSON ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER Administration

MELISSA WEBBER ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER Lifesaving

DR. JEREMY PRUPAS CHIEF VETERINARIAN

Report to the Board of Animal Services Commissioners

MEETING DATE: March 12, 2019

PREPARED BY: Brenda Barnette

REPORT DATE: March 6, 2019

TITLE: General Manager

SUBJECT: RECOMMENDATION TO SUPPORT SENATE BILL NO. 313 (HUESO) – PROHIBITION ON THE USE OF WILD AND EXOTIC ANIMALS IN TRAVELING ANIMAL ACTS

BOARD ACTION RECOMMENDED:

- 1. **SUPPORT** State Senate Bill No. 313 (Hueso) Prohibition on the Use of Wild and Exotic Animals in Travel Animal Acts, also known as the Circus Cruelty Prevention Act; and
- 2. **AUTHORIZE** staff to transmit this recommendation to the Mayor and City Council for consideration of adoption in the form of a Resolution by the City Council with the concurrence of the Mayor.

BACKGROUND:

In February 2019, State Senator Ben Hueso introduced Senate Bill 313 (SB 313) which would prohibit persons from using, or allowing to be used, wild or exotic animals including (but not limited to) giraffes, wolves, alligators, sharks, elephants, lions, monkeys, seals and bears in traveling animal acts. The proposed civil penalty for violating this regulation would be no more than \$25,000.

SUMMARY:

In 2012, the Department recommended the prohibition of bullhooks and other instruments designed to inflict pain for the purposes of training or controlling elephants participating in performances for circuses and similar traveling animal acts. The Los Angeles City Council's support of this recommendation led to the banning of this and similar instruments. SB 313 is a substantial next step following this ban, in protecting the welfare of animals and follows the positive trend being set in other local municipalities that have enacted legislation to restrict or prohibit the use of wild or exotic animals by circuses in their area.

"Creating a Humane LA"

AN EQUAL OPPORTUNITY EMPLOYER

Report to the Board of Animal Services Commissioners SUBJECT: RECOMMENDATION TO SUPPORT SENATE BILL NO. 313 (HUESO) – PROHIBITION ON THE USE OF WILD AND EXOTIC ANIMALS IN TRAVELING ANIMAL ACTS

FISCAL IMPACT:

The support of SB 313 does not impact the General Fund, however the adoption of the Bill by the State may impact future revenues to the Department from the collection of permit fees for traveling animal acts.

Approved:

Brinch 7. Barnets Brenda Barnette, General Manager

Bronaa Bamono, Conorar manag

Attachment: SB 313

BOARD ACTION:

 Passed
 Disapproved

 Passed with noted modifications
 Continued

 Tabled
 New Date

Introduced by Senator Hueso

February 15, 2019

An act to add Chapter 4.5 (commencing with Section 2430) to Division 3 of the Fish and Game Code, relating to wild and exotic animals.

LEGISLATIVE COUNSEL'S DIGEST

SB 313, as introduced, Hueso. Wild and exotic animals: prohibition on use in traveling animal acts.

Existing law regulates the taking and possession of birds, mammals, fish, reptiles, and amphibians, including the importation, transportation, possession, and live release of wild animals, as defined.

This bill would prohibit a person from using, or allowing to be used, a wild or exotic animal, as defined, in a traveling animal act, as defined. The bill would impose a civil penalty for each violation of its provisions.

Vote: majority. Appropriation: no. Fiscal committee: yes. State-mandated local program: no.

The people of the State of California do enact as follows:

SECTION 1. Chapter 4.5 (commencing with Section 2430) is
 added to Division 3 of the Fish and Game Code, to read:

Chapter 4.5. Circus Cruelty Prevention Act

6 2430. This chapter shall be known and may be cited as the7 Circus Cruelty Prevention Act.

8 2431. For purposes of this chapter, the following terms have 9 the following meanings:

99

1 (a) "Mobile or traveling housing facility" means a vehicle, 2 including, but not limited to, a trailer or railway car, used to 3 transport or house an animal used in a performance.

(b) (1) "Performance" means any animal act, carnival, circus,
display, exhibition, exposition, fair, parade, petting zoo, photo
opportunity, presentation, public showing, race, ride, trade show,
or similar undertaking in which animals perform tricks, give rides,
or are used as accompaniments for the entertainment, amusement,
or benefit of a live audience.

10 (2) "Performance" does not include either of the following:

11 (A) An exhibition at a nonmobile, permanent institution or 12 facility accredited by the Association of Zoos and Aquariums or 13 the Global Federation of Animal Sanctuaries.

(B) An outreach program devoted to imparting knowledge or
information about the exhibited animal's behavior, habitat, life
cycle, migratory patterns, feeding habits, or similar pedagogical
information conducted by, or affiliated with, a nonmobile,
permanent institution or facility described in subparagraph (A).

19 (c) "Traveling animal act" means any performance that requires 20 an animal to be transported to or from the location of the 21 performance in a mobile or traveling housing facility.

(d) "Wild or exotic animal" means any live animal from any of
 the following scientific classifications, as specified parenthetically:

24 (1) Artiodactyla (such as hippopotamuses, giraffes, camels, and

25 llamas, but excluding domesticated cattle, swine, sheep, and goats).

26 (2) Canidae (such as wolves, but excluding domesticated dogs).

27 (3) Crocodilia (such as alligators and crocodiles).

28 (4) Elasmobranchii (such as sharks).

- 29 (5) Elephantidae (elephants).
- 30 (6) Felidae (such as lions, tigers, and leopards, but excluding31 domesticated cats).
- 32 (7) Marsupialia (such as kangaroos).
- 33 (8) Primates (such as apes, monkeys, and lemurs).
- 34 (9) Perissodactyla (such as zebras, tapirs, and rhinoceroses, but
- 35 excluding domesticated horses, donkeys, and mules).
- 36 (10) Pinnipedia (such as seals, sea lions, and walruses).
- 37 (11) Ratitae (such as ostriches, rheas, cassowaries, and emus).
- 38 (12) Ursidae (bears).
- 39 (13) Xenarthra (such as sloths).

1 2432. Notwithstanding any other law, no person shall use, or 2 allow to be used, a wild or exotic animal in a traveling animal act. 3 2433. A person who violates this chapter, or any rule or 4 regulation adopted pursuant to this chapter, shall be liable for a 5 civil penalty of no more than twenty-five thousand dollars 6 (\$25,000) for each violation.

0

99

BOARD OF ANIMAL SERVICES COMMISSIONERS

LARRY GROSS

OLIVIA E. GARCIA

COMMISSIONERS

ALISA FINSTEN

JOSE SANDOVAL

ROGER WOLFSON

City of Los Angeles

CALIFORNIA



ERIC GARCETTI MAYOR DEPARTMENT OF ANIMAL SERVICES 221 N. Figueroa Street 6TH Floor, Suite #600 Los Angeles, CA 90012

(888) 452-7381 FAX (213) 482-9511

BRENDA F. BARNETTE GENERAL MANAGER

TAMMY WATSON ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER Administration

MELISSA WEBBER ASSISTANT GENERAL MANAGER Lifesaving

DR. JEREMY PRUPAS CHIEF VETERINARIAN

Report to the Board of Animal Services Commissioners

MEETING DATE: March 12, 2019

REPORT DATE: March 6, 2019

PREPARED BY: Brenda Barnette

TITLE: General Manager

SUBJECT: RECOMMENDATION TO AMEND THE LOS ANGELES MUNICIPAL CODE TO PROHIBIT RODEO EVENTS IN THE CITY OF LOS ANGELES

BOARD ACTION RECOMMENDED:

- 1. **RECOMMEND** to the Mayor and City Council that the Los Angeles Municipal Code (LAMC) be amended to prohibit rodeo events in the City of Los Angeles; and
- 2. **AUTHORIZE** staff to transmit the recommendation to the Mayor and City Council and request the City Council to direct the appropriate City staff to prepare an ordinance amending the LAMC to reflect the recommended changes.

BACKGROUND:

Each year the City of Los Angeles host rodeo exhibitions or contest in which participants perform various activities involving animals, including riding broncos, roping calves and/or wresting steers. These events can be harmful to the health and well-being of the animals that are used in the rodeo competitions and shows, at times resulting in injuries such as sprains and broken limbs.

SUMMARY:

In keeping with the City's practices regarding the welfare and well-being of animals, the Department is recommending the prohibition of rodeo events in the City of Los Angeles. These events include:

- Bull riding;
- Calf riding
- Wild cow milking;
- Mutton busting;
- Chute dogging;

"Creating a Humane LA"

AN EQUAL OPPORTUNITY EMPLOYER

- Goat tying;
- All animal "scrambles";
- Greased pig contests;
- Chuck wagons; and
- Wild horse races

Other local cities including San Francisco, Pasadena, Irvine and Chino Hills, California have already instituted regulations to restrict or prohibit rodeos taking place in their cities.

FISCAL IMPACT:

The prohibition of rodeo events in the City of Los Angeles may result in some impacts to future revenues to the Department from the collection of permit fees for rodeos.

Approved:

Brinds 7. Barnette

Brenda Barnette, General Manager

Attachment: Draft Motion for the Prohibition of Rodeos

BOARD ACTION:

Passed

Disapproved

Passed with noted modifications

Continued

Tabled

New Date

MOTION

Rodeos (and rodeo-type events, namely bull riding as well as charreadas/ charrerias) are events during which the institutionalized abuse of steers, calves, bulls and horses (among others) is sanctioned in the guise of competition. These animals suffer strains, sprains, broken limbs and even broken necks for no discernibly legitimate reason. Even the casual observer can see how the roping, wrestling and other actions can be extremely harmful to the animals, and it is surprising more of them are not seriously injured as they are hobbled, jerked and wrenched around during the "competitions."

Additionally, these popular (though non-sanctioned) rodeo events specifically must be banned: wild cow milking, mutton busting, all animal "scrambles," greased pig contests, chuck wagon and wild horse "races," et al. Nor should we ever forget, that rodeo is merely a detour en route to the slaughterhouse for nearly ALL these animals, horses and bulls included. Even barrel racing can be problematic; there are reports of drug abuse with unsound horses as well as injuries to the horses for performing these tricks. Lastly, there's the Jr. Rodeo (as well as the "challenged buckaroo" rodeo), with its chute dogging, calf riding, mutton busting and goat tying events- all of them cruel.

For these reasons, a growing number of jurisdictions have prohibited rodeos, or the implements, equipment and/or tools without which rodeos cannot be conducted. Among them are the Cities of Fort Wayne, IN, Pasadena, CA, Irvine, CA, Laguna Woods, CA, Chino Hills, CA, Pittsburgh, PA, San Francisco, CA, Southhampton, NY as well as Napa County. There are also numerous rodeo bans outside of the US, most recently being the entire province of Quebec, Canada.

The City of Los Angeles has become a national leader in protecting the rights and welfare of animals. It would be in keeping with the City's strong animal welfare ethic to make sure that this is the case by prohibiting the staging of rodeos and rodeo type events within the city limits.

I THEREFORE MOVE that the City Council instruct the City Attorney to prepare an ordinance amending the Los Angeles Municipal Code to prohibit the staging of rodeos and related events (such as bull riding) with the Los Angeles city limits.

References:

Butterwick, D.J., Lafave, M.R., Lau, B.H.F., Freeman, T. (2011). Rodeo Catastrophic Injuries and Registry: Initial Retrospective and Prospective Report. *Clinical Journal of Sports Medicine*, 21 (3), pp 243-248

Curnutt, Jordan (2001). Animals and the Law: A Sourcebook. ABC-CLIO, Inc.; Santa Barbara, CA. ISBN 1-57607-147-2

Kaplan, Jared (2012). Toros, Steers, Ropes, Capes, and Cowboy Boots: The Inhumane Nature of Bullfighting and Rodeos. *Mid-Atlantic Journal on Law and Public Property*, 1 (1), pp 52-95

Larson, Peggy (1998). Rodeo is Cruel Entertainment. *Pace Environmental Law Review*, 16 (1), pp 115-123